

Four Important issues



by
Engg. Fazlullah Sabri Chishti
(M. Tech)

FALAAH RESEARCH FOUNDATION

الصلوة والسلام على من لا نبي بعده

FOUR IMPORTANT ISSUES (Chaar Ahem MASA'IL)

By:

Engg. **Fazlullah Sabri Chishti** (M. Tech.)

Issued by:

FALAAH RESEARCH FOUNDATION

Published by:

AD-DARUS SUNNIYA

R. No. 5, Gr. Floor, Motiwala Mension, Duncan Road, Near
Two Tank, Mumbai - 400008 India

www.falaah.co.uk email: abdullahalchisti@yahoo.com

Cell: 098679 34085

All Rights Reserved.

Book's Name: Four Important Issues

Author : Engg. Fazlullah Sabri Chishti

No. of Pages : 62

First Edition : March 2010

Qty: 1000

2nd Edition : October 2010

Qty: 1100

Price : Rs. 30/-

Available at:

☆ **Kutub Khana Amjadia, 425, Matia Mahal, Jama Masjid, Delhi - 6**

☆ **Raza Publication, 37/C, Memonwada Road, Mumbai - 3**

☆ **Naaz Book Depot, Bhendi Bazar, Mumbai - 3**

☆ **Raza Movement, 13, 6th Cross, Muneshwara Nagar, Shampur**

Main Road, Bangalore - 45

CONTENT

Sr.No.	Topics	Pg No.
1.	Difference in salah between men and women	5
2.	The distance of Feets in Salah	25
3.	Movement of fingers during Tashahhud in Salah	42
4.	When to stand up during Iqamah	57

PREFACE

For a long time, I have been contemplating compiling a book in an attempt to clear some misunderstandings pertaining to some issues of jurisprudence. These misunderstandings, that lead the way to wrong actions, are a result of lack of fiqh, i.e., understanding, prevalent in some sections of the muslim society as a result of 'taqleed' [following] of pseudo scholars of the twentieth century who went against the preserved traditions of islam, and the major imams of the past 1200 years that includes all the distinguished companions of the prophet (peace unto him), who have helped in its preservation.

My intention of writing this particular book, is to deal with four such issues that have been misunderstood by some people, and present to you the authentic prophetic traditions along with the practices and statements of the great imams of the past. These issues are: **Difference in salah between men and women, The distance of Feet in Salah, Movement of fingers during Tashahhud in Salah, When to stand up during Iqamah.**

I pray that Allahuta'ala accepts this book and make it a means of enlightening Muslims on this topic. Ameen.

I express my thanks to Allama Yaseen Akhtar Misbahi, Mawlana Anwar Amjadi and Dr Ghulam Yahya Anjum for helping me in understanding these fiqh issues.

I would also like to thanks Janab Zubair Qadri for providing me continuous motivation and support.

Fazlullah Sabri Chishti

25th Safarul Muzaffar, 1431 Hijri

10th February 2010

(Part I)

Difference in salah between Men and Women

Wahabis (so called "salafis"/ahlul-hadith) are of the view that all the laws of salah are common to both men and women, and that there is no difference between them. They also claim that the hadith 'Pray as you have seen me praying' is general and, therefore, should be applied equally to both men and women. It should be realised, however, that our own interpretation and logical inference of this hadith cannot compare with the other ahadith of the Messenger of Allah (Sallal laho alaihi wasallam) and the verdicts and practice of the Sahaba and Tabi'un (Radi Allaho anhum) quoted below.

Wahabis are of the view that all hadith should be accepted and understood on the literal meaning. It is because of this fallacy they have fallen in the wrong path of anthropomorphism (tajsim). If we take the literal meaning of this hadith in which prophet [sallal lahu alaihi wa sallam] said: "Pray as you have seen me praying" then no human being on the face of this earth can pray, because no one alive today has seen the way of prophet's prayer. This explains that this hadith has to be understood in a way in which the scholars of ahlus sunnah wal jam'ah have explained.

The Shariah has ordained distinct rules for men and women in many important questions of salah.

For example:

(1) Jum'ah is fardh upon men but not on women, and the Eid prayer is wajib for men but again not for women.

الجمعة حق واجب على كل مسلم في جماعة الا اربعة: عبد مملوك أو امرأة أو صبي أو مريض.

Sayyiduna Tariq bin Shihab Radi Allaho anhu reports that the Prophet (Sallal laho alaihi wasallam), said, Jum'ah in congregation is an obligatory duty upon every Muslim except four people: a slave, a woman, a child, and one who is sick."

[Sunan Abu Dawood hadith 1067, Mustadrak of Imam Hakim hadith 1062, Imam Hakim declared it sahih and Imam Dhahabi agreed]

Sayyidatuna Ummu Aliyyah (Radi Allahu ta'ala anha) says as part of a longer hadith, 'We have been forbidden from following funerals and there is no Jumuah upon us.'

[Sunan Abu Dawood, hadith 1139, Sahih Ibn Khuzaima 1722]

(2) Unlike men, women should not give adhan or say the iqamah.

Women are not allowed to call out the adhan whereas men are encouraged to do so.

Sayyidatuna Asmaa (Radi allahu ta'ala anha) narrates as part of a longer hadith that the Prophet (Sallal laho alaihi wasallam) said, 'There is no adhan iqamah or Jumuah upon women.'

[Sunan Baihaqi hadith no 1921]

Sayyiduna Ibn Umar (Radi allahu ta'ala anhu) says 'There is no adhan or iqamah upon women.'

ليس على النساء أذان ولا إقامة

[Musannaf Abdur Razaaq, Sunan Baihaqi hadith 1920]

Imam Ibrahim Nakha'i Rahmatullah [d. 96 AH], a great taaba'i and faqih (jurist) of Iraq who was also the teacher of Imam Abu Hanfia (rahmatullah) states that adhan and iqamah are not compulsory upon women.

(3) There is a great difference in the awrah of a man and that of a woman in salah. Women must cover their entire body including the hair, leaving only the face, hands and feet exposed.

Ummul Mu'mineen Aisha (Radi allahu ta'ala anha) reports that the Prophet (Sallal laho alaihi wasallam) said, 'Allah does not accept the salah of a mature female without a scarf.'

لا تقبل صلاة حائض الا بخمار.

Musnad Ahmad 24012, Sunan Ibn Majah 655, Sunan Abu Dawood 641, Sunan Tirmidhi 377, Sahih Ibn Khuzaima 775, Mustadrak of Imam Hakim 917 and Sunan Baihaqi 3254.

Imam Hakim declared it sahih and Imam Dhahabi agreed.

(4) Women cannot lead men in salah.

Abu Bakrah Radi Allaho anhu reports that the Prophet (Sallal laho alaihi wasallam) said 'Never will those people succeed who have appointed a woman over them.

لن يفلح قوم ولوا أمرهم امرأة.

[Musnad Ahmad 19507, Sahih al Bukhari 4163, Sunan Tirmidhi 2262, Sunan Nasai 5388]

Jabir bin Abdullah Radi Allaho anhu reports as part of a longer hadith that the Prophet (Sallal laho alaihi wasallam) said, 'Know that a woman should not lead a man in salah.'

ولا تؤمن امرأة رجلا.

[Sunan Ibn Majah 1081 and Sunan Baihaqi 5131]

(5) For the purpose of correcting or deterring someone in salah men should say 'Subhaanallah' loudly, whilst women are only allowed to clap their hands.

Sayyiduna Abu Hurairah Radi Allaho anhu reports that the Prophet (Sallal laho alaihi wasallam) said, 'Tasbeeh is for men, and clapping is for women.'

التسبيح للرجال والتصفيق للنساء.

[Sahih Bukhari 1145]

(6) The different postures and positions of the females.

The different postures, positions and rulings concerning the prayers of the female are not the invention of a group or an individual but teaching of the Prophet (Sallal laho alaihi wasallam) himself. He was the very first person differentiate between the prayer of a man and a woman.

Rasoolullah (Sallal laho alaihi wasallam) has clearly differentiated between the sajdah of men and women.

Yazid bin Abi Habib reports that the Prophet (Sallal laho alaihi wasallam) passed by two women who were praying salah. He said, 'When you prostrate, let part of your body cling to the earth, for women are unlike men in this regard'.

ان رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم مر على امرأتين تصليان فقال اذا سجدتما

فبعض اللحم الى الارض فان المرأة ليست في ذلك كالرجل.
[Abu Dawood in his al Maraseel (Muassasah al Risalah edition),
and Sunan Baihaqi 3201]

Sayyiduna Ibn Umar Radi Allahu anhu narrates that the Prophet (Sallal laho alaihi wasallam) said, 'When a woman sits in salah she should place one thigh over the other, and when she prostrates she should press her stomach to her thighs in a manner that is the most concealing for her. Indeed Allah looks at her saying, "Oh my angels! I make you witness that I have forgiven her."

من عبدالله بن عمر قال قال رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم اذا جلست المرأة في الصلوة وضعت فخذهما على فخذهما الاخرى واذا سجدت الصقت بطنها في فخذيها كالستر ما يكون لها وان الله تعالى ينظر اليها ويقول يا ملائكتي اشهدكم اني قد غفرت لها.

[Sunan Baihaqi 3199]

The above Hadith is reliable due to the fact that it is supported by many other Ahadith

(7) Rasoolullah (Sallal laho alaihi wasallam) has not allowed women to raise their hands up to the ears in salat as men do.

Sayyiduna Wail bin Hujr Radi Allahu anhu reports that the Prophet (Sallal laho alaihi wasallam) said, 'Oh Ibn Hujr! When you pray make your hands level with your ears. And the woman shall raise her hands close to her bosom.'

يا وائل بن حجر اذا صليت فاجعل يديك حذاء أذنيك والمرأة تجعل يديها حذاء ثدييها.

[Tabarani in al M'ujam al Kabeer 22/19 no.28. Hafidh Haithami says in Majma' Al-Zawaaid 2/103, 'Tabarani has narrated it as part of a long hadith on the virtue of Wail bin Hujr, with a chain of Maimoona bint Hujr narrating from her auntie Umme Yahya bint Abdul Jabbar.]

Abdu Rabbihi reports: "I saw Ummu Darda raising her hands up to her shoulders in salat"

رأيت أم الدرداء ترفع يديها في الصلاة حذو منكبيها.
(Juz Rafi Yadain by Imam Bukhari)

(8) Woman cannot stand in the Saff (row) of men. They have to stand behind the men.

صليت أنا ویتیم فی بیتنا خلف النبی صلی اللہ علیہ وسلم وأمی أم سلیم خلفنا.

Anas Radi Allaho anhu reports: "An orphan and I performed salat behind Rasoolullah (Sallal laho alaihi wasallam) and my mother, Ummu Sulaim, stood behind us" [Sahih Bukhari]

This hadith indicates that even if a woman is alone, she has to stand behind the saffs (rows) of males and still not join the males in their saff (row).

(9) The reward of congregational salat for men is 27 (twenty seven) times more than that of an individual salat. Contrary to this, the more rewarding salat of a woman is that which is most concealed and performed within the confines of her home and of her innermost living quarters.

Sayyiduna Abdullah bin Mas'ud Radi Allaho anhu reports that the Prophet (Sallal laho alaihi wasallam) said, 'The prayer of a woman in her makhda' (partition) is better than her prayer in her hujrah (chamber), and her prayer in her hujrah is better than her prayer in her bait (house).' (Abu Dawood 570 and Ibn Khuzaima 1690)

Sayyiduna Abu Huraira Radi Allaho anhu narrates that the Prophet (Sallal laho alaihi wasallam) said, The most beloved salah to Allah of a woman is one that she performs in the darkest spot of her home.'

Ibn Khuzaima 1691 and Tabarani in al-M'ujam al-Kabeer as mentioned by Hafidh Haithami 2/35. Hafidh Haithami also says that its narrators are authentic.

صلاة المرأة في مخدعها أفضل من صلاتها في بيتها و صلاتها في بيتها أفضل من صلاتها في حجرتها.

[Sahih Ibni Khuzaima]

Abdullah bin Mas'ood Radi Allaho anhu reports that Rasoolullah (Sallal laho alaihi wasallam) said: "The most beloved salat to Allah of a woman is the one that she performs in the darkest spot of her home."

ما صلت امرأة من صلاة أحب الى الله من أشد مكان في بيتها ظلمة.

[Majma' Al-Zawaaid- Hafidh Haithami has classified all the narrators as authentic]

We derive some very important and fundamental principles about the prayer of a woman from all the above ahadith. The laws of salah are not always the same for men and women.

The sunnah posture of a female in any position of salah is that which is the most concealing for her.

The following chapters of hadith explain this meaning in detail.

As mentioned earlier, this variation in the salah of a woman has been prescribed by none other than the Prophet (Sallal laho alaihi wasallam) himself.

It has remained the practice of the whole ummah till this day and is also reflected in the rulings of the Sahaba and Taabi'un.

The ulama and fuqaha of all four schools have always recognised this difference and, as is evident in their books of fiqh, have always observed the above principles whenever making a ruling about the salah of a woman.

Following are a few narrations detailing the verdicts and practice of the Sahaba and together with the verdicts of some of the Tabi'un and the ulama of the different schools of fiqh.

Verdicts and practice of the Sahaba (Radi Allaho anhum)

1. Ali Radi Allaho anhu said: "When a woman makes sajdah (prostrates), she should practise ihtifaaz and keep her thighs close together."

["Ihtifaaz": where a woman draws herself close together and leans onto one side by resting on their left buttocks and completely contracting themselves. To draw out the right leg to one side of the body and place the left leg beneath one's right thigh. In this way the posterior will come to rest on the ground rather than on the left leg. She would, therefore, not be resting on her legs, but on her posterior as mentioned in the narration of Sayyiduna Ali]

عن علي، قال: اذا سجدت المرأة فلتحتفز، ولتضم فخزيها.

[Musannaf Ibni Abi Shayba, vol 2, pg 504, #2793, Al-Majlis al-Ilmi]

Abdur-Razzaq has taken it from Isra'il from Abu Is'haq from Harith from Ali and Ibn Abi Shayba took it from Abul-Ahwas from Abu Is'haq and Bayhaqi took it from Abul-Ahwas, with the mentioned sanad.

Imam Abdur-Razzaq has quoted the following hadith in his Musannaf: Ali says, "When a woman prostrates, she must practise ihtifaz and keep her thighs close to her stomach."

(al-Musannaf li-Abdur-Razzaq: vol. 3, p. 138)

2. Ibn Abbas Radi Allahu anhu was asked about the salaah of a woman; he replied: "She must draw herself close together and do ihtifaz"

عن ابن عباس: أنه سئل عن صلاة المرأة؟ فقال: تجتمع و تحتفز.

[Musannaf Ibne Abi Shayba, vol 2, pg 505, #2794, Al-Majlis al-Ilmi]

3. Khalid bin Iajlaaj reports: "Women were commanded to do tarabbu' when they sat in salah and that they should not sit like men on their buttocks"

عن خالد بن اللجلاج، قال: كن النساء يؤمرن أن يتربعن اذا جلسن في الصلاة، ولا يجلسن جلوس الرجال على أو راکهن.

[Musannaf Ibni Abi Shayba, vol 2, pg 506, #2799, Al-Majlis al-Ilmi]

["Tarabbu": to sit cross legged, that is, to draw out one's right leg towards the right side of the body and to place the left leg beneath the right leg.]

4. Nafi' reports that Safiyya (Radi Allahu anha) used to perform salat while in the tarabbu' position.

عن نافع: أن صفية كانت تصلي وهي متربعة.

[Musannaf Ibni Abi Shayba, vol 2, pg 506, #2800, Al-Majlis al-Ilmi]

5. Nafi' reports: "The womenfolk of Ibn Umar would do tarabbu' while in salat"

عن نافع، قال: كن نساء ابن عمر يتربعن في الصلاة.

[Musannaf Ibni Abi Shayba, vol 2, pg 507, #2805, Al-Majlis al-Ilmi]

6. Abdullah ibn Umar was asked: how women performed their salah during the era of Rasoolullah (Sallal laho alahi wasallam)? He replied: "Initially they performed tarabbu'. Then they were ordered to do ihtifaz."

عن ابن عمر أنه سئل كيف كن النساء يصلين على عهد رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم قال: كن يتربعن ثم أمرن أن يحتفرن.

[Sharh Musnad Abi Hanifa, pg 191, Ilmiyya, Jami' ul-Masana'id vol.1, p. 400]

Note: 1. This hadith clearly indicates that the practice of "Tarabbu" was abrogated and women were not allowed to sit in the "Tarabbu" posture anymore.

2. The chains of narrators in the above Hadith are authentic.

Verdicts of the Taabi'un and other Ulama:

1) Ibn Jurayj reports, 'I asked Ataa: "Should a woman motion with her hands at the time of takbeer as a man does?" he replied, "She should not raise her hands with takbeer in the manner of men." Ataa then demonstrated (the way in which she should.) He placed his hands very low and then pulled them towards him. He then said, "The posture of a woman in salah is not that of a man."

[Musannaf Abdur Razzaq 5066, Musannaf Ibn Abi Shayba 2474]

Hammad ibn Salamah al-Basri used to say that a woman should raise her hands parallel to her breast when beginning salah.

[al-Musannaf li-Ibn Abi Shayba]

2) Ataa also says, 'A woman should pull herself together when she bows down into ruk'u: she should bring up her arms to her stomach and pull herself together as much as possible. When she prostrates she should bring up her arms close to her and press her bosom and stomach against her thighs, she should pull herself together as much as possible.

[Musannaf Abdur Razzaq 5069]

3) Hasan al Basri says [Rehmatullah], 'A woman should pull herself close together in sujud. [Musannaf Ibn Abi Shayba 2781]

4) Hasan al basri and Qatada both say, 'When a woman prostrates she should pull herself together as much as possible. She should not allow any space between her limbs so that her posterior is not raised.

[Musannaf Abdur Razzaq 5068]

5) According to the narration of Abu Dawood, Imam Ahmad was

asked about how a woman should sit in salah. He replied, 'She should press her thighs together.

6) Imam Mujahid used to dislike that a man attach his stomach to his thighs as a woman does.

[al-Musannaf li-Ibn Abi Shayba, vol. 1, p. 270]

7) Imam Ahmad was asked about how a woman should prostrate and sit for tashahhud. He replied, 'She should do whatever is more concealing for her.' He added, 'She should do tarabb'u in tashahhud and draw her legs to one side.

[Masaail of Imam Ahmad narrated by his son Abdullah]

8) Imam Baihaqi says, 'All of the laws of salah in which a woman differs from a man are based on the principle of satr (concealment). This means that the woman is instructed to do all that which is more concealing for her.

قال الشيخ رحمه الله وجماع ما يفارق المرأة فيه الرجل من احكام الصلوة راجع الى الستر وهو انها مأمورة بكل ما كان استرلها.

[Sunan Al-Kubra al-Baihaqi, vol 2, pg 222, Idarat Al-Talifaat]

9) Qadhi Iyadh has also quoted from some Salaf that the sunnah for women is tarabb'u. [Awjaz al Masalik 2/119]

All the above quite clearly demonstrates that the prayer of a woman is different in some aspects from that of a man, and that this distinction was first made by none other than the Prophet (Sallal Iaho alaihi wa sallam), and then maintained by the prominent Sahaba and Taabi'un. Furthermore, as can be seen in their works, there is almost universal agreement amongst the scholars of all schools of fiqh on this issue.

List of differences between the prayer of a man and a woman:

Some of the differences as mentioned in the books of fiqh are listed below. In all the postures and movements of salah, including qiyam, ruk'u, sajdah, and tashahhud a woman should adopt that which is the most modest and concealing for her.

Raising Hand:

At the beginning of salah a woman should not raise her hands to

her ears but only to her shoulders or close to her bosom. Men raise their hands all the way to the ear for Takbeer while women raise their hands only up to their shoulders.

Imam Ahmad bin Hanbal also says that she should raise them slightly and, according to one narration, she should not raise them at all.

Qiyam (The standing posture)

(1) In Qiyam (the standing posture) Men place their hands below Navel while women place their hands on their chest. In qiyam, (the standing posture) women are to place their hands on their bosoms. They can fasten them in any one of the different ways 'akdh' (grasping) or 'wadh' (placing), or they can simply rest the right palm on the left one.

Ruku (The bowing posture)

In Ruku (the bowing posture) Men's back is horizontal while women suppose to bend their back only far enough to touch their knees. Looking from far it will look like a bow arc. They won't flatten their back.

Unlike men, in ruk'u, women should tuck their arms into the body and not spread them outward. They should also merely place their hands over their knees with closed fingers, and not grasp them with the fingers spread wide open.

In some books of Hanafi fiqh it has been suggested that in ruk'u they should also bend their backs and knees slightly. The Hanbali scholar Imam Kharqi also says as part of a longer statement, 'The woman should gather herself in ruk'u and sujud.' (al-Mughni 1/134.)

In fact, women should try to keep their fingers close together in all the postures of salah.

Prostration

During prostration men should allow for some space and distance between their stomachs and thighs, and arms and the side of the body, whilst women should press these limbs together. Again in prostration, men should raise their arms off the ground and allow

for some distance but women should let them cling to the ground.

In Sajdah men's back portion is raised from ground and hands apart from body and fingers of feet twisted while women it is supposed to be gathered in a way so that all their body parts are close together and abdomen placed over her thighs. Both feet and ankles sticking out to the right and lower portion of back touching the ground.

Sitting in between two prostrations and sitting to recite Tashahhud.

During Jalsa and Qaida (sitting between Sajdah and during Attahyat) men sit on their left ankle and their right foot's fingers are twisted while women sit on floor and their both ankles and feet sticking out towards right hand side.

During the sitting of tashahhud, men are to rest on their legs and raise their right foot with the toes facing qibla, whereas women are to take out both their legs towards the right hand side of the body and rest on the posterior without raising their right foot.

Statements of Imams of Fiqh concerning salah of women:

Hanafi Fiqh

Imam Muhammed Amin Ibn Abidin As-Shami Rahmatullah [d.1252 AH] writes:

"A woman should raise her hands till her shoulders. She should not take her hands out of her sleeves. She must place her one palm over the other on her breast. She must bend slightly in ruku. She will not spread her fingers out in ruku but rather keep them close together and place her palms on her knees without clasping them. She must bend her knees slightly. She must contract herself in ruku and sajdah. She must place her arms flat on the ground. She must sit with her legs out and resting on her posterior in tashahhud. In tashahhud she must keep her fingers close together. If any mistake occurs in salah, she must clap her hands without uttering anything. She cannot make Imamat of a male. It is makruh to have female only congregation. The female Imam will stand in their midst. It is makruh for her to attend the congregation. In a mixed congregation the females will stand at

the rear. Jum'ah is not obligatory on her but if she attends it, she will be absolved of responsibility. Neither is (salah of) Eid compulsory on her nor the takbeer of tashriq. It is not mustahab for her to perform fajr when it brightens up. In the loud salah, she will not raise her voice".

[Radd al-Muhtar ala ad-Dur al-Mukhtar Vol 1, page 504. With reference from Bahrur Raiq and Ghunyat al-mutamalli fi Sharh Munyat al-musalli]

Imam Muhammed Amin Ibn Abidin As- Shami Rahmatullah writes:

"A woman should bend slightly in ruku without spreading her fingers out completely. However, she must contract herself and place her palms on her knees and bend them slightly. She must not spread out her arms as this is more concealing her".

[Radd al-Muhtar ala ad-Dur al-Mukhtar, Vol 1, p504]

Mulla Ali Qari Rahmatullah [d. 1014 AH] writes:

"A woman will raise her hands till her shoulders (when performing takbeer e tahrimah)" [Sharh Niqaya, Vol 1, p 239]

Imam Badrud din Aini [d.855 AH] writes:

"According to Ummud-Darda, Ata, Zuhri and Hammad, the ustadh of Imam Abu Hanifa rahmatullah a woman should raise her hands till her breasts"

[al-Binaya fi sharh al-Hidayah, Vol 2, p 187]

Muhammed Ibn Muqatil narrates the same verdict from the hanafi jurists.

[as above]

Imam Burhan uddin Ali bin Ali B. Marghinani Rahmatullah [d. 511 AH], the author of Al-Hidaya states that this is the correct and accepted version.

[Al-hidaya, Vol 1, p 50]

Imam Abu Jafar At-Tahawi Rahmatullah [d. 321 Ah] writes:

"As for woman, our scholars (hanafi) state that she must sit in a manner that is most concealing".

[Mukhtasar Ikhtelaf al-Ulama, Vol 1, p 212]

It is stated in the Fatawa Aalamgiriya:

"As for a female she must bend slightly in ruku' without spreading her fingers out. She must keep them together on her knees by merely placing the palms. She must bend her knees slightly and not spread her arms out.

A female should not spread out in ruku' and sajdah while she will sit on her legs. In sajdah she will make her stomach rest on her thighs.

A woman will sit on her left buttock and position her legs out to the right side." (al-Fatawa al-Alamgiriya: vol. 1, p 75)

Maaliki Fiqh

Imam Dardir writes in Sharh al -sahgir:

"As for woman she will remain contracted in all postures"

[Sharh al-saghir, Vol 1 , p 329]

Imam Abu Zayd Qayrawani rahmatullah [d.386 AH] writes in his book Ar-Risala:

"A woman should contract herself during sajdah (prostration)."

Shafi'i Fiqh

Imam Abu Zakariya An Nawawi rahmatullah (d. 676 AH) writes:

"A woman will join her limbs together"

[al-Majmu' sharh al-Muhadhdhab]

Hafiz Ibn Abdal Barr [d.463 AH] writes:

Imam Shafi rahmatullah [d.204 AH] said:

"A woman should sit in the most concealing position".

[Al-Istidhkar, Vol 4, P 268]

Imam Ibn Hajar al asqalani rahmatullah [d.852 AH] writes:

"A woman should not spread her limbs out (during prostration)".

[Talkhisul Habir, Vol 1, p 252]

Hanbali Fiqh

Imam Abdullah Ibn Qudama Al Maqdisi rahmatullah [620 AH]

writes:

"A woman should draw her legs out to her right side. Imam Ahmed bin hanbal rahmatullah preferred this position for women".
[Al-Mughni, Vol 1, p 502]

Imam Ibn Qudama writes further:

"Concealment is preferred for a woman. It is for this reason that extending the limbs out is not mustahab for a female".
[Al-Mughni, Vol 2, p 202]

The ahadith and the statements of the jurists indicate that a woman should contract herself completely during salah and try to conceal her as much as possible. From the ahadith it can be seen that Rasool- Allah (Salla laho alaihi wasallam) has clearly differentiated between the sajdah of men and women and also other postures in the salah (prayer).

The companions, taab'i, tabe-taab'i, all of them have accepted and practiced this method of salah for women. There has been no difference of opinion in this ummah on this issue. There is no statement of any sahabi, taab'i or jurist that declares the salah of males and females as the same.

Recently a deviant sect known as wahabi (ahle hadith/ salafi) have started to propagate the view that salah of males and females is one and the same. This has no basis from Qur'an, sunnah or the action of the salaf as-saliheen.

Objection and its refutation:

Wahabi scholar Albani who died in 1420 AH/1999 wrote a book "Sifat Salat ai Nabi" [Prayers of the prophet]. This book has many mistakes and it contains ruling which is against Qur'an and sunnah. In this book Albani has expressed his view that the salah of males and females is one and the same. This view of Albani is against ahadith of prophet and actions of the companions.

Analysis of wahabi evidence and its refutation:

Wahabi [Ahle hadith] evidence No1:

Hadith of the prophet [Salla laho alaihi wasallam] says "سلوا كما"

رَأَيْتُمُونِي أُصَلِّي (pray as you have seen me pray). This hadith is a general hadith and does not distinguish between salah of male and female. Hence male and female should perform salah with same posture.

[Sifat Salat al-Nabi, p. 189]

Analysis and Refutation:

If we take literal meaning of the hadith 'Pray as you have seen me pray' it will mean no human being on face of this earth can pray because none among us have seen with our eyes the method of prophet's prayer.

This Hadith cannot be used to prove that women are like men in all aspects of Deen. The Ahadith above are sufficient evidence to show that men and women are not equal in all aspects of Deen. The meaning of the above Hadith is that women resemble men with regards to their body constitution. This is because Hawwa (Alaiha salam) was created from Adam (Alaiha salam) and thereof the progeny of men and women began.

The general principle is that women are equal to men in all religious rulings, because of the hadith: "Women are counterparts of men." (Reported by Imam Ahmad bin hanbal), except when there is evidence of a specific ruling which applies only to women. One of the cases in which the scholars mention specific rules for women is Prayer (salah). Since a specific ruling over-takes a general ruling, all those ahadith which differentiates between salah of males and females will be accepted and acted upon.

Not a single traditional Muhaddith and expert commentator of Hadith has interpreted the above Hadith as it is interpreted by wahabis. Thus, it will be illogical for us to accept this interpretation.

Even if we had to accept this "principle" that women are like men in all aspects, then this principle only applies to those cases where there are no proofs indicating to the contrary. In the issue of women's salat, there are many Ahadith in which Rasoolullah (Sallal laho alaihi wasallam) differentiated between the salat of both genders.

Wahabi (Ahle hadith) evidence No 2:

Albani writes:

وهو قول ابراهيم النخعي قال (تفعل المرأة في الصلاة كما يفعل الرجل) [89]
أخرجه ابن أبي شيبه (2 / 75 / 1) بسند صحيح عنه

This is the view of Ibrahim An-Nakha'i who said:

تفعل المرأة في الصلاة كما يفعل الرجل

to perform the prayer as

'A woman does in prayer as does a man'

It has been transmitted by Ibn Abi Shayba with an authentic chain" (Sifatu Salatin Nabi by Albani)

Analysis and Refutation:

Ibrahim An-Nakha' rahmatullah was a famous taab'i. By quoting him Albani is trying to prove Ibrahim Nakahi was of the opinion that salah of male and a female is one and the same.

Albani has misquoted Ibrahim An Nakhai!

Actual hadith found in the Musannaf of Imam Ibn Abi Shayba is "تفعل المرأة في الصلاة كما يقعد الرجل" which means "A woman sits in prayer as sits a man."

As a side note, this athar of An-Nakha'i actually means it is only permissible for a woman to sit in the same posture of a man. This quotation indicates permissibility.

In fact another narration shows Ibrahim An-Nakha'i said that a woman should sit to her side (which Al-Albani conveniently overlooked):

ابراهيم قال: تجلس المرأة من جانب في الصلاة.

Ibrahim said "A woman sits to the side in prayer." [Musannaf Ibn Abi Shayba]

Wahabi (Ahle hadith) evidence No 3:

Imam Bukhari reported in at-Tareekh as-Sagheer (p.95) with a sahih sahad from Umar ad-Darda "that she used to sit in her prayer just as a man sits, and she was a woman of understanding."

Analysis and Refutation:

Imam Bukhari has quoted this narration without any chain of narration. Hence it cannot be accepted.

However Imam Ibn Abi Shayba has also quoted this hadith in his musannaf. Ibn Abi Shayba narrates: "Makhul reports that Umm ud-Darda used to sit like males in salaah. "

[al-Musannaf li-Ibn Abi Shayba: vol. 1, p 270]

It is incorrect to use this narration for the following reasons:

1. Hafizh Jamaal ud-Din Yusuf al-Mizzi has mentioned her among the Taabi'in. (Tahzheeb al-Kamaal fi-Asmaa ir-Rijaa!; vol.22 p 464). The practice of a lone taab'i is incorrect to adopt even if it may not be contrary to the principles.

Hafiz Ibn Hajar Asqalaani states in Fath ul-Baari:

"The practice of a lone Taab'i, even though it may not contradict any principle, will not be used as proof. " (Fath ul-Baari: vol. 2, p 243)

Al-Haafiz stated in Fath al-Baari that Abu'l-Darda' had two wives, both of whom were called Umm al-Darda'. Hafizh Ibn Hajar has only counted her among the Taabi'in. He says:

"It can be realised from the narration of Makhul that that narration refers to the younger Umm ud-Darda, the Taab'iyah, not the elder sahabiyyah because Makhul met the former not the latter." (Ibid)

2. Even if it accepted that she was a Sahabiyyah, then the narration becomes munqati' [broken] and will not be acceptable according to the principles of the Muhaddithin. It will also be regarded as her opinion. She did not encourage anyone else to follow her practice. Neither did she present any action or statement of Rasoolullah nor the fatwa of any Khalifa.

Accordingly, with regard to the salah of women, the position of this opinion in the face of the practically adopted method of the ummah (tawaatur) is like the position of shaaz qira'a has opposed to mutawatir qira'ah. It is very clear that no muslim leaves the mutawatir qira'ah for the shaaz qira'ah.

3. Furthermore, if one examines the words of this narration

carefully, it supports the view of the majority. The sitting posture of Umm ud-Dardaa has been compared to the posture of males in this narration which infers that the posture of the other Sahabiyyat was different as mentioned previously.

4. Imam Abu Ja'far at-Tahaawi rahimahullah has narrated the following hadith:

"Ibrahim Abi Abalah reports that he saw Umm ud-Dardaa performing salaah cross-legged."

[Tuhfat al-Akhyaar bi-Tarteebi Sharh Mushkil al-Aathaar li-Abi Ja'far at-Tahaawi: vol. 2, p 338, Hafizh Mizzi has narrated this atharin Tahzheeb al-Kamaal: vol. 22, p 468]

قال رأيت أم الدرداء تصلي متربعة.

Ibrahim bin Abi Ablah narrates: "I saw Ummu Darda performing salat in the Tarabbu' position" (Tuhfa Al-Akhyaar, vol 2, pg 338, Dar Balansiyya)

This narration contradicts the one mentioned by Ibn Abi Shayba rahimahullah.

It will accordingly not remain worthy of substantiating any Shar' law. In another narration of Musannaf Ibn Abi Shaybah (vol. 1 p270), one finds the following words:

Ibrahim said: "A woman should sit in salah as a man does."

Wahabi (Ahle hadith) evidence No 4:

The hadith of Abu Mutee' al-Hakam ibn 'Abdullah al-Balkhi from 'Umar ibn Dharr from Mujahid from 'Abdullah ibn Umar who said: The Messenger of Allah (sallallahu alaihi wasallam) said: "When a woman sits during the prayer she should place one thigh against the other and when she prostrates she should press her stomach against her thighs, compressing herself in the most concealing manner, for Allah looks at her and says: 'O My angels, I call you to bear witness that I have forgiven her.'"

[Sunan al-Bayhaqi al-Kubra, 2/222]

This hadith is da'eef, [weak] because it was narrated by Abu Mutee' al-Balkhi.

Ibn Hajar said:

Ibn Mu'een said: He is nothing. On one occasion he said: He is da'eef. Al-Bukhaari said: He is da'eef. Al-Nasaa'i said: He is da'eef.
[Lisaan al-Mizaan, 2/334]

Ibn 'Adiyy said: It is clear that Abu Mutee' is da'eef in his ahadith and everything that he narrated, and for most of his narrations there are no corroborating reports.

[Al-Kaamil fi Du'afa' al-Rijaal, 2/214]

Analysis and Refutation:

According to the principles of "hadith" laid down by the Fuqaha and Muhadithun, this hadith can be relied on, since it is supported by many other Ahadith and verdicts of Sahaba, who were the students of Rasoolullah (Sallal laho alaihi wasallam). It is supported by many "Shawahid" (a term of Usul al Hadith).

Wahabi (Ahle hadith) evidence No 5:

A third hadith was narrated from Yazeed ibn Abi Habeeb, saying that the Messenger of Allaah (Sallal laho alaihi wasallam) passed by two women who were praying. He said: "When you prostrate, press some of your flesh to the ground, for women are not like men in that."

This was narrated by Abu Dawood in al-Maraseel (p. 118) and by al-Bayhaqi (2/223).

This hadith is mursal, which is a category of da'eef (weak).

Analysis and Refutation:

The issue of woman's salat is purely a fihi issue and has to be dealt with in the light of what the Fuqaha state. They were masters in understanding the meanings of the Ahadith as stated by the great Muhaddith and student of Imam Bukhari, Imam Tirmidhi (rahimahullah). The Fuqaha of all four mazdahib accept "Mursal" ahadith, but obviously with certain conditions (Athar Al-Hadith al-Shareef). Therefore, it will be totally incorrect to blatantly state that "This hadith is mursal, which is a category of da'eef (weak)" indirectly inferring that this hadith cannot be accepted.

Wahabi (Ahle hadith) evidence No 6:

The only evidence that counts is the words of Allah and His Messenger (Sallal laho alaihi wasallam).

Analysis and Refutation:

It is incorrect to state "but the only evidence that counts is the words of Allah and His Messenger (Sallal laho alaihi wasallam)". This statement infers that the statements of Tabi'un and Ulama cannot be accepted. This is totally incorrect and goes against the teachings of the Qur'an and the Ahadith. Allah Ta'ala mentions in the Qur'an:

يَا أَيُّهَا الَّذِينَ آمَنُوا أَطِيعُوا اللَّهَ وَأَطِيعُوا الرَّسُولَ وَ أُولَى الْأَمْرِ مِنْكُمْ.

"O those who believe obey Allah and obey his messenger and those in authority amongst you" (Sura Nisa: 59)

Early commentators of Qur'an such as Ibn Abbas, Mujahid and Hasan Basri have stated that "those in authority amongst you" refer to the Fuqaha and Ulama (Ma'arif Al-Qur'an). We are commanded to follow the teachings of Tabi'un and Ulama for there teachings are based on the Qur'an and Ahadith.

OOOO

(Part II)

THE DISTANCE OF FEET IN SALAH

In this fourteenth century of the Islamic era, a recently mushroomed sect known as the wahabis/ahle-hadith/salafis, has invented some new rules which they believe are the sunnat teachings of Rasoolullah (Sallal laho alaihi wasallam). In spite of their views being in conflict with the teachings of the self-e-saaliheen (muslims of the first three generations) belonging to the noblest ages of islam (Khairul Quroon), they obstinately cling to their misguided opinions. Their method is to subject the ahadith to their personal understanding. In spite of the divergence which this self-opinion produces from the way of the ummah inherited from the sahaba, the salafis/wahabis intransigently cling to their deviation.

A little reflection would convince them that it is not possible that the aimma-e-mujtahideen [great scholars] who were the students of the sahaba [companions] would propagate acts which are in conflict with the sunnah. Any act which has been accepted and practised by the entire ummah from the earliest era of islam cannot be deviation. Deviation will be the act which is in conflict with this sacred unanimity.

One of the erroneous practices of the salafis/wahabis/ahle hadith is their act of spreading their legs wide apart during salaah (prayers). In the bid to touch the toes of the musalli (person performing salaah) standing adjacent to them, they disfigure their stance and ruin their composure with the mental pre-occupation of touching the toes of the musallis standing on both sides in the saff (row) during jamaah salaah (congregational prayers). Even when performing salaah alone, they stretch the legs hideously apart. But for this innovation they have absolutely no shar'i [jurisprudence] evidence. A solitary hadith which makes reference to 'foot with foot' has been grievously misunderstood and misinterpreted by them. Besides their misinterpretation, they have intentionally ignored all the other shar'i proofs which refute their interpretation.

A perusal of the relevant ahadith on this subject will convince every unbiased muslim that the salafi/wahabi interpretation of the hadith is a concoction of the nafs [evil desire]. It is a concoction designed and prepared by shaitaan to create rifts and discord in the ummah. When people opt to abandon the practices which the aimma mujtahideen [great scholars] have reported on the basis of the authority of the sahaba, then manipulation based on desire is evident.

All four madhabs [schools of jurisprudence] of the ahlus sunnah wal jama'ah unanimously refute the wahabi/salafi contention on the position to be adopted when standing for salaah. None of the madhab teaches that the legs should be spread out widely when standing for salaah or that the toes of the musalli alongside should be touched. Some of the wahabis/salafis go to great lengths in spreading their legs in the bid to touch the next man's toes causing annoyance and much irritation.

The emphasis on straightening the sufoof (sufoof is the plural of saff which refers to the row of people performing salaah [prayer] in a congregation)

The ahadith of Rasoolullah (Sallal laho alaihi wasallam) emphasise the straightening of the sufoof. The emphasis in all the hadith narrations dealing with this subject is directed to proper saff (row) formation, not on the feet of the musallis touching the toes of the musalli standing alongside as the wahabis/salafis inordinately and inconsiderately practice.

In the endeavour to sustain the practice of stretching the legs wide open while performing salaah, the wahabis/salafis have gone to the extreme of adopting this ugly stance even when performing salaah alone. While a man who is uneducated in the laws of the shariah may misunderstand the solitary hadith in which reference has been made to "foot with foot", the same mistake cannot and should not be made in so far as salaah performed alone because the question of "foot with foot" is not remotely related to infiraadi salaah, i.e. performing salaah alone.

The wahabis/salafis may abortively argue that the aim of spreading the legs wide apart is to ensure straightness of the sufoof, but what argument do they have for justifying this

unbecoming practice when a man is performing salaah individually? Furthermore, there is no hadith narration in this regard which could even be misinterpreted to support the case of a munfarid [individual] stretching his legs to the extremities of east and west or north and south, depending on the location of the qibla from where he happens to be.

The wahabis/salafis claim that it is sunnah to stretch the legs wide apart and for a musalli's toes to touch the toes of the musalli standing alongside him in the saff. This ludicrous position is imposed by the salafis on even women who are obliged to stand with their legs wide open. What an ugly, miserable and immodest stance for a woman to adopt? A woman is an object of concealment according to the statement of Rasoolullah (Sallallahu alaihi wasallam). When she has to stretch her legs wide open, she adopts the stance of lewd and shameless women. Throughout salaah, a woman's postures are to be constricted – made small and drawn in, not asserted like a man asserts and expresses his actions during salaah.

As far as their stance is concerned for the munfarid [salah performed individually, without congregation] there is not a single hadith which they can cite in substantiation for their view which anyhow is utterly baseless. All the relevant ahadith on this topic teach the contrary, namely, that the feet should be held slightly apart -- about four to five inches (10 cm). There also exists consensus of the four madhabs on this issue.

As far as the feet position for the saff is concerned, the wahabis/salafis conveniently overlook all the ahadith which negate their corrupt view and intransigently cling to a view which they have understood to be the method. In taking to this view, they deliberately cast aside what exactly the hadith in question says. They took a single word (namely 'foot with foot') out of the context of the hadith and formulated the practice of stretching the legs wide apart and touching the toes of the musallis standing alongside on either side in the saff. For understanding this issue, it is best that we cite all the relevant ahadith.

Before all the ahadith on the issue of position of feet in salah is discussed, the wahabi/ahlul hadith/salafi view should be presented first.

Wahabis/salafis/ahlul hadith propagate and practice that:

Men and women have similar postures in salah. This has been refuted earlier. Men and women should stretch their legs wide apart in prayer so as to touch the foot of the person standing next to them. This widening of foot is practiced in congregational prayer as well as prayer performed without congregation [jama'at].

Now we present ahadith on this topic.

Hadith 1

Hadhrat Umar Radi Allahu anhu narrates that Rasoolullah (Sallal laho alaihi wasallam) said: "Straighten the sufoof (rows), line up the shoulders, close the gaps and become tender in the hands of your brothers. Do not leave any gaps for shaitaan [satan]. Whoever joins the saff (row), Allah will join him. And whoever cuts the saff Allah will cut him."

[Bukhari, Abu Dawood 662, Sunan Nasai 818]

[Become tender: that is to comply when a brother musalli (person performing prayer) in the row touches your shoulder indicating that you should bring it in line with the shoulders of the other musallis in the saff(row).]

Hadith 2

Hadhrat Baraa' Bin Aazib Radi Allahu anhu narrates that Rasoolullah (Sallal laho alaihi wasallam) used to enter the saff from end to end, touching our chests and our shoulders. He would say: "Do not be irregular (in your rows), for then your hearts will become irregular (i.e. discord will overtake you)." He would (also) say: "Verily, Allah Azza Wa Jal and His malaika dispatch salaam on the first sufoof" [When the word 'Salaam' is related to Allah ta'ala, it denotes rahmat, i.e. He sends down mercy. When it is related to the malaika [angels], it means that they supplicate to Allah ta'ala to send His mercy upon His servants.]

Hadith 3

حدثنا أحمد ابن أبي رجاء قال حدثنا معاوية بن عمرو قال حدثنا زائدة بن قدامة قال حدثنا حميد الطويل حدثنا أنس بن مالك قال أقيمت الصلاة فأقبل

علينا رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم بوجهه فقال أقيموا صفوفكم وتر
اصواف اني أراكم من وراء ظهري.

Narrated Anas bin Maalik: Once the Iqama was pronounced and Allah's Apostle faced us and said, 'straighten your rows and stand closer together, for I see you from behind my back.' [Bukhari]

Hadith 4

حدثنا أبو الوليد هشام بن عبد الملك قال حدثنا شعبة قال أخبرني عمرو بن
مرة قال سمعت سالم بن أبي الجعد قال سمعت النعمان بن بشير يقول قال
النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم لتسون صفوفكم أو ليخالفن الله بين وجوهكم.

Narrated An-Nu'man bin Bashir: The Prophet said, "Straighten your rows or Allah will alter your faces." [Bukhari]

Hadith 5

حدثنا أبو الوليد قال حدثنا شعبة عن قتادة عن أنس بن مالك عن النبي صلى
الله عليه وسلم قال سوا صفوفكم فان تسوية الصفوف من إقامة الصلاة.

Narrated Anas bin Maalik: The Prophet said, "Straighten your rows as the straightening of rows is essential for a perfect and correct prayer. [Bukhari]

Hadith 6

حدثنا عمرو بن خالد قال حدثنا زهير عن حميد عن أنس بن مالك عن النبي
صلى الله عليه وسلم قال أقيموا صفوفكم فاني أراكم من وراء ظهري وكان
أحدنا يلزق منكبه بمنكب صاحبه وقدمه بقدمه.

Narrated Anas bin Maalik: The Prophet said, "Straighten your rows for I see you from behind my back." Anas added, "Every one of us used to put his shoulder with the shoulder of his companion and his foot with the foot of his companion." [Bukhari]

Hadith 7

حدثنا مسلم بن إبراهيم ثنا أبان عن قتادة عن أنس بن مالك عن رسول الله
صلى الله عليه وسلم قال: رصوا صفوفكم وقاربوا بينها وحاذوا بالأعناق. فو
الذي نفسي بيده اني لأرى الشيطان يدخل من خلل الصف كأنها الحذف.

Sayyiduna Anas Radi Allaho anhu narrates that Rasoolullah Sallal laho alaihi wasallam said, 'Pull your rows together, keep them close and keep your necks in line, for by He in Whose hands rests the soul of Muhammad, indeed I see the shayateen entering the gaps in the row as though they are small sheep.'

(Ahmad 13324, Abu Dawood 667 and Nasai 815)

Hadith 8

Sayyiduna Nu'maan bin Basheer Radi Allaho anhu says, 'Rasoolullah Sallal laho alaihi wasallam turned his face to the people and said thrice, "Straighten your rows." (He then said,) "By Allâh, you will straighten your rows or Allâh will make your hearts differ." (Sayyiduna Nu'maan bin Basheer continues,) I saw each man join his shoulder with the shoulder of the person next to him, his knee with his knee, and his ankle with his ankle.'

(Ahmad 17962, Abu Dawood 662, Ibn Khuzaima 160, Ibn Hibban 2173 and Daraqutni 1080.)

Hadith 9

Maalik Ibn Abi Aamir Ansari Radi Allaho anhu narrates: "Uthmaan Bin Affaan Radi Allaho anhu would recite in his khutba: 'When the Salaat is ready, arrange the sufoof properly and line up with the shoulders' (i.e. the shoulders of the musallis should all be in line and touching)."

(Muatta Imam Muhammad)

Analysis of ahadith

Certain people, however, take some aspects of the above ahadith literally and insist on joining their ankles and feet with the person next to them throughout salâh. Their understanding of the ahadith is at odds with that of the scholars of hadith and fiqh.

The wahabis/salafis of this age, while grabbing the words 'foot with foot', ignore 'neck with neck', 'shoulder with shoulder', 'knee with knee' and 'ankle with ankle'.

The narration (hadith 7) commands musllai (those performing salah) to keep their necks in straight line.

How would wahabis/salafis explain this that if two person of different height are standing next to each other in a row during

salah then their neck would not be in a straight line, rather the neck of the shorter person will be near the chest of the taller person, making necks in zigzag path rather than a straight line!

In the same way one narration (hadith 8) commands joining of the knees.

If we take the literal meaning of this hadith which wahabis/salafis take, then we have to join our knee with the knee of the person standing next to us in sufoof (row), which is PRACTICALLY IMPOSSIBLE if the two person are of different height, because the height of knee from ground will be different for two person of different height!

Thus, joining knees to knees is impossible, hence, it becomes clear that the meaning of the hadith is encourage and emphasize filling of the gaps and straightening of the rows, and not the actual joining and sticking. This is why Al Khatabi said about the hadith that has been narrated by Ibn Abbas {Radi Allaho anhu} from the Prophet {Sallallaho alaihi wasallam} that he said "the best of you are those of you who have the most gentle shoulder in salah" {Abu Dawud and others., "the meaning of it is to have tranquility throughout the salah, and to be comfortable within it, and not to push nor rub against the shoulders of the one next to him" {Mu'aalim As Sunan, and Awn Al Ma'bood Fi Sharh Sunan Abu Dawud: vol.2 pg. 369]

Similarly, if the literal sense of the 'ankle with ankle' has to be accepted, it will place the musallis [people performing salah] under great stress to achieve what is not simple because the protruding heels are barriers for this achievement.

If the wahabis/salafis claim to follow the literal meaning of ahadith then why do they choose only 'foot with foot' out of the several instructions pertaining to the joining of various bodily parts? For this choice they have only their desire -- no evidence whatsoever. What is the determining factor to choose only feet and to ignore necks, knees, shoulders and ankles?

On the other hand, the Ahlus Sunnah Wal Jama'ah -- the followers of the four madhhabs have a mass of evidence to support 'joining of the shoulders'. Furthermore, joining or lining up of the shoulders is simple, rational and fulfils in the best way the

instruction of straightening the saff [row].

It should be noted that the emphasis is on closing the gaps. There should be no gap between two musallis standing in the saff (row). But, the wider the legs are spread apart, the more the distance between the shoulders will increase. Thus, spreading the legs wide apart defeats the very command issued in the Hadith to close the gaps and straighten the sufoof (row).

All this meaning: straightening the row, making it parallel and the even, and filling the gaps, does not mean to literally "join or stick {ilzaaq}", for indeed joining shoulders to shoulders in every standing is clearly burdensome, joining knee to knee is also impossible, and joining ankle to ankle is to a certain extent unattainable in addition to it being burdensome, difficult, and busying oneself in every rakat, which is clear and apparent.

The intention behind it being to encourage the establishing of the rows, consolidating it, making it straight and even without any crookedness or spaces.

In order to achieve 'foot with foot' literally, the salafis/wahabis are constrained to turn their feet at angles away from the qibla.

Ibn Sa'd (4/157) related from Ibn Umar that he liked to point whatever of his body he could towards the Qibla when praying, even his thumbs.

It is also ordered openly by the hadith: "During salaah do your best to keep all your limbs pointing towards the Qibla!" (Nasbur Rayah, 32th. hadith)

In this hideous exercise they manage only to touch the toes of the adjacent musalli with much difficulty and irritation to those whose peace of mind is disturbed with the unruly encroachment of his companion's toes. When the toes are made to touch with the feet in diagonal positions, the shoulders cannot touch; the knees, ankles, necks, etc. are thrown completely out of alignment.

When shoulders are not lined up, it is impossible to achieve straight sufoof. It is for this reason that the hadith emphasises more on shoulders. Feet are mentioned only once. The Sahaba and the taab'in relate the instruction 'to line up' and straighten the saff to the shoulders, necks, knees, ankles and the feet. In other

words, all these should be in line, not out of alignment. It is for this reason that the hadith clearly mentions that the Khulafa-e-Raashideen, in fact Rasoolullah (Sallal laho alaihi wasallam) himself, would order protruding chests to recede into line. Never did any of the authorities of the shariah speak about feet which should touch.

In the adoption of the wahabi/Salafi mode, the movement is excessive in salaah. Neither is proper ruku (bending) nor proper sajdah (prostration) possible if this hideous posture has to be retained throughout salaah. In fact sajdah is not at all possible with the feet spread wide apart. Therefore, the wahabis/salafis are constrained to shift positions repeatedly when going to ruku'. This excessive movement in salaah is negatory of Khusu' (complete attentiveness to Salah)

The wahabis/salafis claim that it is sunnah to stretch the legs wide apart and for a musalli's [person performing salah] toes to touch the toes of the musalli standing alongside him in the saff (row). This ludicrous position is imposed by the wahabis/salafis on even women who are obliged to stand with their legs wide open. What an ugly, miserable and immodest stance for a woman to adopt? A woman is an object of concealment according to the statement of Rasoolullah (Sallal laho alaihi wasallam). When she has to stretch her legs wide open, she adopts the stance of lewd and shameless women. Throughout salaah, a woman's postures are to be constricted -- made small and drawn in, not asserted like a man asserts and expresses his actions during salaah (prayer).

THE FOUR MADHAB OF AHLUS SUNNAH WAL JAMAH

While the case of the four madhabs is logical, the actual proof for our view is not rational interpretation, but is narrational evidence. Such evidence has been transmitted down the centuries from the Sahaba (companions). It should be understood that the Aimmah-e-Mujtahideen -- the Imams of the madhabs -- had acquired their knowledge of Islam from either the Sahaba or the Taab'in who were the students of the Sahaba. Whatever they taught is therefore, what the companions had instructed. It is the height of folly and deviation to differ with them and to choose a way which is at variance with what they had disseminated. It is not conceivable that the saif-e-saaliheen [all the Imams of the

madhabs were among them] were in deviation and the present-day wahabis/salafis are on rectitude. This is unacceptable to any muslim who is prepared to reflect a bit. The greatest evidence for the view of the madhab is that whatever they teach has been acquired directly from either the Sahaba or the taab'in (companions of the companions).

Explaining these ahadith, Imam Bukhari (Rehmatullah alaih) states in the section captioned: "JOINING SHOULDER TO SHOULDER":

"This is what the Jamhoor [majority] have said: 'Verily, the meaning (of joining in this context) is complete nearness and lining up, not actual joining (or touching).'"

It is for this reason that the title of a chapter in sahih al-Bukhari 'Chapter on the Joining of the Shoulders and Feet Together Whilst Forming the Rows' has been classified by Hafiz Ibn Hajar al asqalani to be based on exaggeration. He writes in his commentary Fath al-Bari:

"[Imam Bukhari's] reason for choosing this specific title is to exaggerate (mubalagha) the importance of straightening the rows and filling the gaps in between."
(Fath al-Bari2:247)

Imam badruddin Aini too has said so. With this, the indication is towards emphasis in straightening the sufoof (rows) and closing the gaps. Imam Qustulaani and others have also said this.

This means that the narration is not to be taken literally. Imam Shawkani, who is constantly referred to by those who prefer not to follow a school of thought (salafis/wahabis) in Islamic jurisprudence, has not taken it for its literal interpretation either. He writes in his book Nayl al-awtar:

"[The statement of the Companion] means, place the parts of the body [shoulders, etc.] in line with each other, so that the shoulder of each person performing prayer is in level with the shoulder of the next person. This way everyone's shoulders, knees and feet will be in a single straight line."
(Nayl al-awtar 3:65)

In clear words, this indicates that the real reason for joining the shoulders and other parts was to straighten the rows, not that the joining itself is an obligatory act.

It should be noted that the emphasis is on closing the gaps. There should be no gap between two musallis standing in the saff. But, the wider the legs are spread apart, the more the distance between the shoulders will increase. Thus, spreading the legs wide apart defeats the very command issued in the hadith to close the gaps and straighten the sufoof (rows).

There is no difference of opinion among the Salf (i.e. Salf-e-Saaliheen) between the stance (of the musalli) in Jama'ah (congregation) and in munfarid (i.e. performing alone). There is no difference regarding the gap (between the feet). It is not that the spreading of the feet should be more in Jama'ah than when performing Salaat alone.

The summary of this is: When we do not find the Sahaba (companions) and the taab'in (companions of the companions) differentiating in their standing position between Jama'ah (congregational prayer) and individual Salaat, then we understand that the only meaning of Rasoolullah's statement of 'joining the shoulders' is to line up closely and to abstain from leaving gaps (between the musallis).

The wahabi/salafi practice of spreading the feet wide apart and the irritating attempt to touch the next man's toes are in conflict with the sunnah as the foregoing shar'i evidences have established.

According to the ahlus sunnah wal jamah the following measures are mustahab between the musallis own feet when praying:

1. According to the Hanafi Madhab, the distance between the feet should be four fingers.

Abdullah Ibn Mas'ud [Radi Allahu anho] saw a person standing in Salah with his two feet together [i.e touching each other] and judged it to be against the sunnah. He advised the person that if he practiced Murawaha it would have been more preferable. [Sunan an-Nisa'i]

Commentary: The Arabic word Murawaha usually means to stand on one foot and then the other, alternating between them as one becomes tired. However, another meaning of Murawaha is to leave a slight gap between the feet, and this seems to be the

most probable meaning of this word in reference to the above narration, since the person had been standing with his feet together. If we take this latter meaning of the term Murawaha, the hadith means that Abdullah Ibn Mas'ud [Radi Allahu anho] instructed the person to maintain a small gap between his feet, since the Sunnah was not to completely join the feet together [nor keep them far apart].

It has been reported that Abdullah bin Umar Radi Allahu anhu would not leave a wide gap in between his feet and nor would he totally join them (in salaah) but he would adopt a comfortable and moderate method i.e. not too close and not too wide. (Al-Mughni Pg. 11, Vol. 2)

The Gap to be left between a person's feet should be equal to that of four fingers of the hand, because this [amount] is very effective in creating [the posture of] submission [sought in prayer]."
[Radd-ul-Muhtar 1:299]

2. According to the Maaliki madhab, the distance should be moderate, neither together nor so wide apart which is considered repugnant.

3. According to the Shafi'i madhab, the gap between the feet should be one hand. It is makrooh to spread the feet wider than this.

4. According to the Hanbali madhab there should be a 'small' gap between the feet of the musalli..

Objections:

Objection 1

Wahabis often quote the hadith of Nu'maan bin Basheer Radi Allahu anhu and say that the companions [sahaba] used to join ankle to ankle while standing in row (saff) during salah.

We have already quoted this hadith above. (hadith no 8).

The hadith is:

Sayyiduna Nu'man bin Basheer Radi Allahu anhu says, 'Fasoolullah Sallal laho alaihi wasallam turned his face to the people and said thrice, "Straighten your rows." (He then said,) "By

Allāh, you will straighten your rows or Allāh will make your hearts differ." (Sayyiduna Nu'maan bin Basheer continues,) I saw each man join his shoulder with the shoulder of the person next to him, his knee with his knee, and his ankle with his ankle.

(Ahmad 17962, Abu Dawood 662, Ibn Khuzalma 160, Ibn Hibban 2173 and Daraqutni 1080)

Refutation

On which basis can wahabis/ salafi choose only "ankle to ankle" and not choose shoulder with shoulder and knee with knee?

We have already seen above that touching knee to knee and touching shoulder to shoulder is not practical. Imam Ibn Hajar al asqalani said "what is intended by this is to greatly emphasize the straightening of the rows and filling the gaps."

["Fath ul-Bari" the explanation of sahih Al Bukhari, vol. 2, pg. 242]

Since the knees can't be joined, the meaning of this as well as the shoulders and ankles is maximum closeness when lining up BEFORE the start of salaah, not that they touch each other literally. When once lined up and ensured the closeness of the row one should take a comfortable stance in the row. And further concentrate on the salaah and not anymore on ankles, knees, or shoulders, or feet (as the wahabis/salafis do at beginning of every new rakaat in prayer)

Upon analysing this hadith, several points come to light:

Firstly, Rasoolullah (Sallal laho alaihi wasallam) never commanded the joining of the ankles. No hadith has yet been found wherein Rasoolullah (Sallal laho alaihi wasallam) himself instructed the sahaba (Radi Allahu anhum) to join their ankles. The sahaba (Radi Allahu anhum) had themselves adopted this manner in order to fulfil the command of straightening the saff (row). Secondly, this hadith clearly mentions that Nu'maan bin Basheer (Radi Allahu anho) saw the sahaba (Radi Allahu anhum) doing this PRIOR to the commencement of the salah. There is no mention of this position being maintained even after the salah had commenced.

Therefore we find that great muhadditheen such as Hafiz Ibn Hajar Radi Allahu anhu and Allama Shawkani have regarded this

as an extreme measure which was occasionally adopted by the sahaba Radi Allahu anhum to ensure that the row is straight.

Objection 2

Wahabis/Salafis also quote another hadith of Anas Radi Allaho anhu and try to propagate their wrong understanding among common people.

This hadith has been recorded by Imam Ibn Abi Shayba.

Anas ibn Maalik narrated to us saying:

"The call for commencing of salaah was made, the Messenger of Allah Sallal laho alaihi wasallam turned to us and said "Straighten your rows and come close together, for indeed I see you behind my back. So I saw each of us adjoining our shoulder with those of our companions and also (adjoining) our feet with those of our companions, but if you were to practice this today, a person would flee (from you) like a restless mule."

[Musannaf Ibn Abi Shayba, Vol. 1, P. 351]

Refutation

This makes it absolutely clear that this practice was merely a measure adopted BEFORE the salah to ensure the straightening of the row. He says: "If I had to do that (join the ankles) with anyone of them (the tabi'een) today, they would run like restless mule".

This simply means that the taabi'een severely disliked that anybody should join their ankles with them. Several points are understood from this: Firstly, Hazrat Anas Radi Allaho anhu had stopped doing this completely. Had this been a sunnah and not just a manner of ensuring that the saff (row) was straight, it is impossible that Hazrat Anas Radi Allaho anhu would have left it out merely upon somebody disliking it.

Secondly, the taabi'een would never have disliked it if they had observed many of the sahaba (Radi Allaho anhum) continuously practicing upon this. It was only due to the fact that they had not generally observed the sahaba (Radi Allaho anhum) adopting this procedure that they disliked it. Hence this makes it crystal clear that the sahaba (Radi Allaho anhum) had only occasionally

adopted this practice to ensure the straightening of the saff (row). It was not a sunnah in itself, otherwise they would never have left it out.

It has already been made clear that Rasoolullah (Sallal laho alaihi wasallam) never himself instructed the joining of the ankles, nor is there any mention of the sahaba (Radi Allaho anhum) having maintained this position even IN salah. However, if for a moment we do accept that this position must be adopted during the course of the salah as well, the question is: In which posture of salah must this position be maintained? Should it be maintained during qiyam [standing], ruku [bending], sajdah [prostration] and qada [sitting] or only in some of these postures? If one says that the ankles should be joined only in the qiyam [standing] posture, on what basis were the other postures excluded? If it is argued that it is difficult to do so in ruku [bending] and sajdah [prostration], the same could be said for qiyam [standing], since to stand with one's feet spread apart is naturally awkward and hence it presents a certain amount of difficulty and uneasiness for many people.

In short, this practice is not established as a sunnah of salah. It was merely adopted initially by the sahaba (Radi Allaho anhum) BEFORE the commencement of salah to ensure that the rows are straight.

So once the gaps have been filled, the row is straight and where necessary complete, one should adopt a natural posture and keep both feet apart at a comfortable distance.

Certain people, however, take some aspects of the above ahadith literally and insist on joining their ankles and feet with the person next to them throughout salâh. Their understanding of the ahadith is at odds with that of the scholars of hadith and fiqh.

Imam Bukhari has narrated the above hadith of Sayyiduna Anas Radi Allaho anhu in a chapter which he has titled 'Chapter on joining the shoulders and feet in the row.' Hafidh Ibn Hajar says in his commentary of Bukhari, Fath al Bari:

'The meaning of this is to emphasise the straightening of the row and the filling of the gaps in between.'

Even one of the recent Wahabi /Salafi/ahlu hadith scholar (Sheikh

Salih al-'Uthaymin) says this!

س 234: ما المعتقد في إقامة الصفوف؟ وهل يشرع للمصلي أن يلصق كعبه بكعب من بجانبه؟ أفتمونا مأجورين؟ الجواب: الصحيح أن المعتقد في تسوية الصف محاذاة الكعبين ببعضهما بعضاً، لا رؤوس الأصابع، وذلك لأن البدن مركب على الكعب، والأصابع تختلف الأقدام فيها، فهناك القدم الطويل، وهناك القدم القصير، فلا يمكن ضبط التساوي إلا بالكعب، والأصابع تختلف الأقدام فيها، فهناك القدم الطويل، وهناك القدم القصير، فلا يمكن ضبط التساوي إلا بالكعب. وأما الصاق الكعبين ببعضهما ببعض فلا شك أنه وارد عن الصحابة رضي الله عنهم. فانهم فانا يسوون الصفوف بالصاق الكعبين بعضهما ببعض، أي أن كل واحد منهم يلصق كعبه بكعب جاره لتحقيق المحاذاة وتسوية الصف، فهو ليس مقصوداً لذاته لكنه مقصود لغيره كما ذكر بعض أهل العلم، ولهذا إذا تمت الصفوف وقام الناس ينبغي لكل واحد أن يلصق كعبه بكعب صاحبه لتحقيق المساواة، وليس معنى ذلك أن يلزم هذا الا لصاق ويبقى ملازماً له في جميع الصلاة. ومن الغلو في هذه المسألة ما يفعله بعض الناس من كونه يلصق كعبه بكعب صاحبه ويفتح قدميه فيما بينهما حتى يكون بينه وبين جاره في المناكب فرجة فيخالف السنة في ذلك، والمقصود أن المناكب والأكعب تتساوى.

Question: What is the relied-upon position regarding the straightening of the rows (sufoof)? Is it prescribed for the praying person to join his ankle (ka'b) to the ankle of the person next to him? Please give us the fatwa, may you be rewarded.

Answer: That which is correct is that the relied-upon position regarding the straightening of the row is that the ankles should be in line with each other, not the ends of the toes, and that is because the body is supported upon the ankle, and the feet differ in regard to the toes, because some feet are long, and some feet are short. So it is impossible to ensure straightness except by the ankles (i.e. by the ankles being in line with each other).

As for joining the ankles to the ankles of the others, then no doubt this is reported from the sahaba Radi Allahu anhum, for they would straighten the rows by joining ankles, that is, every one of them would join his ankle with the ankle of his neighbour to ensure being line, and the straightness of the row. So it is not meant as an aim in itself, but rather as a means of achieving

another aim, as some of the people of knowledge have mentioned. Therefore, when the rows are completed and the people are standing, it is befitting for every one of them to join his ankle to the ankle of his companion to ensure straightness. It does not mean that he should continue this joining and remain so for the whole salah.

From the extremism that has occurred with regard to this issue is what is done by some people in that one of them will join his ankle to the ankle of his companion, and he will spread his feet so far apart until there is a gap between his shoulder and the shoulder of his companion, so he will oppose the sunnah by doing that. But the aim is that the shoulders and ankles should be in line with each other.

OOOO

(Part III)

Movement of fingers during Tashahhud in Salah

Nasir al-Albani [d. 1420 AH/1999] is the arch-innovator of the Wahhabis and "Salafis" in our time. A watch repairman by trade, al-Albani was a self-taught claimant to hadith scholarship who has no known teacher in any of the Islamic sciences and has admitted not to have memorized the Book of Allah nor any book of hadith, fiqh, 'arabi, usool, or grammar. He achieved fame by attacking the great scholars of Ahlus-Sunna and reviling the science of fiqh with especial malice towards the school of his father who was a Hanafi jurist. A rabid reviler of the Friends of Allah and the Sufis, he was expelled from Syria then Saudi Arabia and lived in Amman, Jordan under house arrest until his death in 1999. He remains the glib of the people of Innovation, self-styled re-formers of Islam, and other "Salafi" and Wahhabi sympathizers, and the preferred author of book merchants and many uneducated Muslims.

Among the many classical hadith analysis by the self claimed muhaddith "Albani" was his analysis of the hadith dealing with the movement of fingers during Tashahhud in Salah.

The Wahabis keep on moving their fingers up and down in Salah and they say that it is based on a hadith.

The Wahabi sheikh Albani analysed this topic in this way. Please take a note how Albani attacks the scholars of Ahlus sunnah and tries to prove that he alone has understood this hadith in this ummah.

With reference to al-Albani's recently translated book "The Prophet's Prayer described from the beginning to the end as though you see it (Sifah Salah-al-Nabee)", al-Albani claimed (pg. 66):

About "supplicating with it", Imam Tahaawi said, "This is evidence that it was at the end of the prayer." Hence, there is evidence in

this that the Sunnah is to continue pointing and moving the finger until the tasleem, for the supplication is until then. This is the view of Maalik and others. Imam Ahmad was asked, "Should a man point with his finger during prayer?" He replied, "Yes, vigorously." (Mentioned by Ibn Haani in his Masaa'il of Imam Ahmad, 1/80). From this, it is clear that moving the finger in tashahhud is a proven sunnah of the Prophet (Sallal laho alaihi wasallam), and it was practised by Ahmad and other Imams of the Sunnah. Therefore, those who think that it is pointless and irrelevant and has nothing to do with the Prayer, should fear Allah, since because of this, they do not move their fingers although they know it to be an established sunnah; and they take great pains to interpret it in a way which is inconsistent with the 'Arabic way of expression and contrary to the understanding of the Imams with regard to it.

The amazing thing is that some of them will defend an Imam on other issues, even if his opinion conflicts with the Sunnah, with the argument that to point out the Imam's mistakes inevitably means to taunt and disrespect him. They then forget this and reject this established sunnah, at the same time mocking at those who practise it. Whether or not they realise it, their mockery also includes those Imams whom they often defend wrongly, and who are correct about the Sunnah this time! In fact, they are deriding the Prophet (Sallal laho alaihi wasallam) himself, for he is the one who brought us this sunnah, and so jeering at it is equivalent to jeering at him.

As for putting the finger down after pointing, or limiting the movement to the affirmation (saying laa ilaaha: 'there is no god ...') and negation (saying: illallaahu: '... except Allaah'), all of that has no basis in the Sunnah; in fact, it is contrary to the Sunnah, as this hadith proves.

Further, the hadith that he would not move his finger does not have an authentic isnaad, as I have explained in Da'eef Abi Dawood. Even if it were authentic, it is negatory, while the hadith above is affirmatory: the affirmatory takes precedence over the negatory, as is well-known among the scholars.

[End of quote from Al Albani's book]

But when we look up at this Hadith in the English Translation of the Sunan of Imam Abu Dawood (1/984, pg. 252) we found that Abdullah ibn al-Zubair Radi Allahu anhu said : "The Prophet (Sallal laho alaihi wasallam) used to point with his finger (at the end of Tashahhud) and he would not move it."

Imam Muslim (Rehmatullah alaihi) also reported Ibn al-Zubair Radi Allahu anhu narrating from his father:

Sahih Muslim, Kitab al salat, book 4

Chapter 65: HOW JALSA IS TO BE OBSERVED

صحیح مسلم
باب صفة الجلوس في الصلاة وكيفية وضع اليدين على الفخذين.
حدثنا محمد بن معمر بن ربعي القيسي، حدثنا أبو هشام المخزومي، عن
عبد الواحد، وهو ابن زياد. حدثنا عثمان بن حكيم، حدثني عامر بن عبدالله
بن الزبير، عن أبيه، قال كان رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم إذا قعد في
الصلاة جعل قدمه اليسرى بين فخذيه وساقه وفرش قدمه اليمنى ووضع يده
اليسرى على ركبته اليسرى ووضع يده اليمنى على فخذيه اليمنى وأشار
بأصبعه.

Abdullah bin Zubair narrated on the authority of his father: When the Messenger of Allah (Sallal laho alaihi wasallam) sat in prayer he placed the left foot between his thigh and shrank and stretched the right foot and placed his left hand on his left knee and placed his right hand on his right thigh, and raised his finger..

حدثنا قتيبة، حدثنا ليث، عن ابن عجلان، ح قال وحدثنا أبو بكر بن أبي
شيبه، واللفظ له. قال حدثنا أبو خالد الأحمر، عن ابن عجلان، عن عامر بن
عبدالله بن الزبير، عن أبيه، قال كان رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم إذا قعد
يدعو وضع يده اليمنى على فخذيه اليمنى ويده اليسرى على فخذيه اليسرى
وأشار بأصبعه السبابة ووضع إبهامه على أصبعه الوسطى ويلقم كفه اليسرى ركبته.

Abdullah bin Zubair narrated on the authority of his father that when the Messenger of Allah (Sallal laho alaihi wasallam) sat for supplication, i.e. tashahhud (blessing and supplication), he placed his right hand on his right thigh and his left hand on his left thigh, and pointed with his forefinger and placed his thumb on his (middle) finger, and covered his knee with the palm of his left hand.

Also narrated by Abu Dawood [988]

And in the narration of Nasai (1275), Abu Dawood (990) and Ahmad (15668), 'His gaze would not pass beyond his pointing.'

وحدثني محمد بن رافع، وعبد بن حميد، قال عبد أخبرنا وقال ابن رافع، حدثنا عبد الرزاق، أخبرنا معمر، عن عبيد الله بن عمر، عن نافع، عن ابن عمر، أن النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم كان إذا جلس في الصلاة وضع يديه على ركبتيه ورفع أصبعه اليمنى التى تلى الإبهام فدعا بها ويده اليسرى على ركبته اليسرى باسطها عليها.

وحدثنا عبد بن حميد، حدثنا يونس بن محمد، حدثنا حماد بن سلمة، عن أيوب، عن نافع، عن ابن عمر، أن رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم كان إذا قعد في التشهد وضع يده اليسرى على ركبته اليسرى ووضع يده اليمنى على ركبته اليمنى وعقد ثلاثة وخمسين وأشار بالسبابة.

Ibn 'Umar reported that when the Messenger of Allah (Sallal laho alaihi wasallam) sat for tashahhud he placed his left hand on his left knee and his right hand on his right knee and he raised his right finger, which is next to the thumb, making supplication in this way, and he stretched his left hand on his left knee. Another version on the authority of Ibn Umar says: When the Messenger of Allah (Sallal laho alaihi wasallam) sat for tashahhud, he placed his left hand on his left knee and placed his right hand on his right knee, and he formed a ring like (fifty-three) and pointed with his finger of attestation.

Also narrated by Tirmidhi 294 and Nasai 1269.

حدثنا يحيى بن يحيى، قال قرأت على مالك عن مسلم بن أبى مريم، عن على بن عبد الرحمن المعاوى، أنه قال رانى عبد الله بن عمر وأنا أعبث بالحصى فى الصلاة فلما انصرف نهانى فقال اصنع كما كان رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم يصنع، فقلت وكيف كان رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم يصنع قال كان إذا جلس فى الصلاة وضع كفه اليمنى على فخذ اليمنى وقبض أصابعه كلها وأشار بأصبعه التى تلى الإبهام ووضع كفه اليسرى على فخذ اليمنى.

'Ali bin Abdur-Rahman al-Mu'awi reported: 'Abdullah bin Umar saw me playing with pebbles during prayer. After finishing the prayer he forbade me (to do it) and said: Do as the Messenger of

Allah (Sallal lahu alaihi wasallam) used to do. I said: How did Allah's Messenger (Sallal lahu alaihi wasallam) do? He said that he (the Messenger of Allah) sat at tashahhud, placed his right palm on the right thigh and closed all his fingers and pointed with the help of finger next to the thumb, and placed his left palm on his left thigh.

Similar ahadith can be found in other books.

Sayyiduna Wail bin Hujr Radi Allahu anhu says, 'I saw Rasoolullah sallal lahu alaihi wasallam make a circle with his thumb and middle finger, and lift the one next to it (the forefinger) praying with it in tashahhud. [Ibn Majah 912 and Nasai 1264]

All these hadith from sahih Muslim talk about raising finger.

There are other hadith [Sunan Abu Dawood (988, 990), Sunan al-Nasai (1270)] which clearly mentions that prophet DID NOT move his finger.

However, there are few ahadith which is talks about moving finger in tashahhud. But all these ahadith have been narrated by only one narrator. To understand this issue we must first understand what is a 'shadh hadith'. In English 'shadh hadith' is translated as 'deviant or odd hadith'.

One of the conditions for a sahih [authentic] hadith is that the text and transmission of the hadith must be free of shudhudh, or "variance from established standard narrations of it." An example is when a hadith is related by five different narrators who are contemporaries of one another, all of whom relate the same hadith from the same sheikh[teacher] through his chain of transmission back to the Prophet (Sallal lahu alaihi wasallam). Here, if we find that four of the hadiths have the same wording but one of them has a variant wording, the hadith with the variant wording is called shadh or "deviant," and it is not accepted, because the difference is naturally assumed to be the mistake of the one narrator, since all of the narrators heard the hadith from the same sheikh.

Now, all of the versions of the hadith mentioning that the Prophet (Sallal lahu alaihi wasallam) moved his finger [which the salafis/wahabis use] have been related to us by way of Za'ida ibn

Qudama al-Thaqafi, a narrator who is considered reliable, and who transmitted it from the hadith sheikh 'Asim ibn Kulayb, who related it from his father Kulayb ibn Shihab, from Wa'il ibn Hujr al-Hadrami.

But we find that this version of "moving the finger" contradicts versions of the hadith transmitted from the same sheikh, 'Asim ibn Kulayb, by no less than ten of 'Asim's other students, all of them reliable, who heard 'Asim report that the Prophet (Sallallahu alaihi wasallam) did not move but rather pointed (ishara) with his index finger (towards the qibla or "direction of prayer").

Hence it is clear that all the hadith which talks about "moving" finger has been narrated from Zaid ibn Qudama al Thaqafi. This hadith is related by Ahmad (4.318), Bayhaqi (2.132), Ibn Khuzayma (1.354), and Ibn Hibban, with a reliable chain of narrators (thiqat)—except for Kulayb ibn shihab, who is a merely "acceptable" (saduq), not "reliable" (thiqa)—that the Companion Wa'il ibn Hujr al-Hadrami said that when he watched the Prophet (Sallallahu alaihi wasallam) kneeling in the Tashahhud or "Testification of Faith" of his prayer, the Prophet lifted his [index] finger, and I saw him move it, supplicating with it. I came [some time] after that and saw people in [winter] over-cloaks, their hands moving under the cloaks (Ibn Hibban, 5.170–71) This was also reported by Imam Nasai in his sunan (1268) and Ibn Majah (Vol 5, hadith 170)

Imam Ibn Khuzayma mentions:

'There is no mention of the words 'moving it' in any narration except this related by Zaid (ibn Qudama)'.

As mentioned earlier this version of "moving the finger" contradicts versions of the hadith transmitted from the same sheikh, 'Asim ibn Kulayb, by no less than ten of 'Asim's other students, all of them reliable, who heard 'Asim report that the Prophet (Sallallahu alaihi wasallam) did not move but rather pointed (ishara) with his index finger (towards the qibla or "direction of prayer").

These companions of 'Asim (with their hadiths, which are well authenticated (hasan)) are:

Sufyan al-Thawri: "then he pointed with his index finger, putting the thumb to the middle finger to make a ring with them" (al-Musannaf 2.68–69);

Sufyan ibn 'Uyayna: "he joined his thumb and middle finger to make a ring, and pointed with his index finger" (Ahmad, 4.318);

Shu'ba ibn al-Hajjaj: "he pointed with his index finger, and formed a ring with the middle one" (Ahmad, 4.319);

Qays ibn al-Rabi': "then he joined his thumb and middle finger to make a ring, and pointed with his index finger" (Tabarani, 22.33–34);

Abdul-Wahid ibn Ziyad al-'Abdi: "he made a ring with a finger, and pointed with his index finger" (Ahmad, 4.316);

'Abdullah ibn Idris al-Awdi: "he had joined his thumb and middle finger to make a ring, and raised the finger between them to make du'a (supplication) in the Testification of Faith" (Ibn Majah, 1.295);

Zuhayr ibn Mu'awiya: "and I saw him ['Asim] say, 'Like this,'—and Zuhayr pointed with his first index finger, holding two fingers in, and made a ring with his thumb and second index [middle] finger" (Ahmad, 4.318–19);

Abu al-Ahwas Sallam ibn Sulaym: "he began making du'a like this—meaning with his index finger, pointing with it—" (Musnad al-Tayalisi, 137);

Bishr ibn al-Mufaddal: "and I saw him ['Asim] say, 'Like this,'—and Bishr joined his thumb and middle finger to make a ring, and pointed with his index finger" (Abi Dawud, 1.251);

and Khalid ibn Abdullah al-Wasiti: "then he joined his thumb and middle finger to make a ring, and pointed with his index finger" (Bayhaqi, 2.131).

All of these narrators are reliable (thiqat), and all heard 'Asim ibn Kulayb relate that the Prophet (Sallallahu alaihi wasallam) "pointed with (ashara bi) his index finger" during the Testimony of Faith in his prayer. There are many other narrations of "pointing with the index finger" transmitted through sheikhs other than

'Asim, omitted here for brevity—four of them, for example, in Sahih Muslim, 1.408–9). The point is, for illustrating the meaning of a shadh or "deviant hadith," that the version of moving the finger was conveyed only by Za'ida ibn Qudama from 'Asim. Ibn Khuzayma says: "There is not a single hadith containing yuharrikuha ('he moved it') except this hadith mentioned by Za'id (ibn qudama)" [Ibn Khuzayma, 1.354].

In other words, since this same hadith was reported through thirteen other chains of narration, and none of the routes of narration mention the phrase "I saw him moving it" except for one, this specific phrase is considered a shadh (deviant/odd) addition that is to be disregarded, while the rest of the hadith is authentic and is to be acted upon

So we know that the Prophet (Sallalahu alaihi wasallam) used to point with his index finger, and that the version of "moving his finger" is shadh or "deviant," and represents a slip of the narrator, for the word ishara in the majority's version means only "to point or gesture at," or "to indicate with the hand," and has no recorded lexical sense of wiggling or shaking the finger (Lisan al-'Arab, 4.437 and al-Qamus al-muhit (540). This interpretation is explicitly borne out by well authenticated hadiths related from the Companion Abdullah ibn al-Zubair that "the Prophet (Sallalahu alaihi wasallam) used to point with his index finger when making supplication [in the Testification of Faith], and did not move it" (Abi Dawud, 1.260) and that he "used to point with his index finger when making supplication, without moving it" (Bayhaqi, 2.131–32).

سُنَن أَبِي دَاوُد
كِتَابُ الصَّلَاةِ

باب الإِشَارَةِ فِي التَّشَهُّدِ ص 142 ح 1

حَدَّثَنَا عَبْدُ اللَّهِ بْنُ مُحَمَّدٍ النَّفِيلِيُّ، حَدَّثَنَا عُثْمَانُ، يَعْنِي ابْنَ عَبْدِ الرَّحْمَنِ.
حَدَّثَنَا عَصَامُ بْنُ قِدَامَةَ، مِنْ بَنِي بُجَيْلَةَ. عَنْ مَالِكِ بْنِ نُمَيْرٍ الْخَزَاعِيِّ، عَنْ
أَبِيهِ، قَالَ رَأَيْتُ النَّبِيَّ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ وَاضِعًا ذِرَاعَهُ الْيُمْنَى عَلَى فَخْذِهِ
الْيُمْنَى رَافِعًا أَصْبَعَهُ السَّبَّابَةَ قَدْ حَنَاهَا شَيْئًا

Narrated Abu Maalik Numair al-Khuza'i:

I saw the Prophet (Sallal lahu alaihi wasallam) placing his right hand on his right thigh and raising his forefinger curving it a little. [Sunan Abu Dawood, Kitab Al Salat]

Also recorded by Ahmad 15439, Nasai 1274 and Ibn Hibban 1943.

حَدَّثَنَا اِبْرَاهِيْمُ بْنُ الْحَسَنِ الْمَصِيصِيُّ، حَدَّثَنَا حَجَّاجٌ، عَنْ ابْنِ جُرَيْجٍ، عَنْ زِيَادٍ، عَنْ مُحَمَّدِ بْنِ عَجْلَانَ، عَنْ عَامِرِ بْنِ عَبْدِ اللَّهِ، عَنْ عَبْدِ اللَّهِ بْنِ الزَّبِيرِ، أَنَّهُ نَكَرَ أَنَّ النَّبِيَّ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ كَانَ يَشِيرُ بِأَصْبَعِهِ إِذَا دَعَا وَلَا يُحَرِّكُهَا. قَالَ ابْنُ جُرَيْجٍ وَزَادَ عَمْرُو بْنُ دِينَارٍ قَالَ أَخْبَرَنِي عَامِرٌ عَنْ أَبِيهِ أَنَّهُ رَأَى النَّبِيَّ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ يَدْعُو كَذَلِكَ وَيَتَحَامَلُ النَّبِيُّ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ بِيَدِهِ الْيُسْرَى عَلَى فَخْذِهِ الْيُسْرَى.

Narrated Abdullah ibn az-Zubair: The Prophet (sallal lahu alaihi wasallam) used to point with his finger (at the end of the tashahhud) and he would not move it. [Sunan Abu Dawood, Kitab Al Salat]

In al-Nasa'i (1270) it says: "He used to point with his finger when making du'a but he did not move it."

In Bayhaqi (Sunan Bayhaqi, 2.131-32, hadith 2786) it says: "he used to point with his index finger when making supplication, without moving it."

In Musnad Abu Awanah 2/226 (Dar al Ma'rifah edition, Beirut) it says: he would not move it.

In Baghawi (masabih as-sunnah) (676) it says: he would not move it.

Imam Nawawi has declared it sahih in his al Majmu' 3/454

Although the hadith of moving fingers during tashahhud is sahih (authentic) it will not be acted upon because it is a shadh (dviant/odd) hadith. This has been explained in the beginning.

Finally, we may note that Imam Bayhaqi has joined between the Za'ida ibn Qudama hadith (which is odd/deviant) and the many hadiths that apparently contradict it by suggesting that moving the finger in the Za'id ibn qudama's hadith may mean simply lifting it (rafa'a), a wording explicitly mentioned in one version recorded by Imam Muslim that the Prophet (Sallal lahu alaihi wasallam)

"raised the right finger that is next to the thumb, and supplicated with it" (Sahih Muslim).

Imam al-Bayhaqi said:

يَحْتَمِلُ أَنْ يَكُونَ الْمُرَادُ بِالتَّحْرِيكِ الْإِشَارَةَ لَا تَكَرِيرَ تَحْرِيكِهَا، فَيَكُونُ مُوَافِقًا
لِرَوَايَةِ ابْنِ الزُّبَيْرِ، وَذَكَرَ بِإِسْنَادِهِ الصَّحِيحِ عَنْ ابْنِ الزُّبَيْرِ رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُمَا
أَنَّ النَّبِيَّ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ كَانَ يُشِيرُ بِأَصْبَعِهِ إِذَا دَعَا لَا يَحْرِكُهَا. رَوَاهُ
أَبُو دَاوُدَ بِإِسْنَادٍ صَحِيحٍ.

"It is possible that he meant by moving it, pointing with it, not a repetition of movement, and that would make it agree with the narration of Ibn al-Zubair."

Then he narrated with an authentic isnaad back to Ibn al-Zubair (Radi Allahu anhu) that the Prophet sallal lahu alaihi wasallam would point his finger in du'a without moving it.

So according to Bayhaqi, the contradiction is only apparent, and raising the finger is the "movement" that Wa'il saw from the Prophet (Sallal lahu alaihi wasallam) and the people's hands under their cloaks, according to Za'ida ibn Qudam's version, which remains, however, shadh or "deviant" from a hadith point of view, unless understood in this liminary sense.

Ruling from Fiqh schools

Hanafi School

'Abdullah bin Zubair narrated on the authority of his father that when the Messenger of Allah (Sallal laho alaihi wasallam) sat for supplication, i.e. tashahhud (blessing and supplication), he placed his right hand on his right thigh and his left hand on his left thigh, and pointed with his forefinger, and placed his thumb on his (middle) finger, and covered his knee with the palm of his left hand. [Sahih Muslim]

Imam ibn abideen wrote a monograph Rafa at-Taraddud fi Aqdi'l Asabiyy inda't Tashahhud on this subject which also examines different ways of raising this finger. The chosen position from various of hanafi resources is that which is narrated from imam abu ja'far [at-Tahawi] that you should leave the fingers open and

just before you say " laa," clasp the last two fingers within the palm; make a circle with the tip of the thumb and the middle finger and then raise the index finger. After the saying of the name of Allah you drop the finger.

In the Muatta of Imam Muhammad (Rahmatullah aliyh) it is written:

Maalik has informed that Muslim ibn Abi Maryam informed from Ali ibn Abdur Rahman al-Muawiy that he said, 'Abdullah ibn Umar [Radi Allahu anhu] saw me whilst I was playing with pebbles in Salaat. When I turned (after completing my Salaat), he prevented me saying 'do as Nabi [sallallaahu alayhi wasallam] did.' I asked, 'what was Nabi's practice?' he said, 'When Nabi sat in Salaat, he placed his right hand on his right thigh and he clasped all his fingers and pointed with the finger next to the thumb, i.e. index finger and he placed his left hand on his left thigh. -

Imam Muhammad [Radi Allahu anhu] said, 'We adopt the practice of Nabi [sallal lahu alaihi wasallam] and this is the view of Imam Abu Hanifa [Radi Allahu anhu]'

Mailiki Fiqh

Imam Maalik also only mentioned pointing of the indexfinger and not moving of it in his Mo'atta:

Section: Behaviour in the Sitting in the Prayer, Book 3, Number 3.13.51

Yahya related to me from Maalik from Muslim ibn Abi Maryam that Ali ibn Abdur-Rahman al-Muawi said, "Abdullah ibn Umar saw me playing with some small pebbles in the prayer. When I finished he forbade me, saying, 'Do as the Messenger of Allah, may Allah bless him and grant him peace, did.' I said, 'What did the Messenger of Allah, may Allah bless him and grant him peace, do?' He said, 'When he sat in the prayer, he placed his right hand on his right thigh and he closed his fist and pointed his index finger, and he placed his left hand on his left thigh. That is what he used to do.

Ibn Abi Zayd al-Qayrawani (d. 389 AH) says in his Risala on Maaliki Fiqh:

"While you are saying the tashahhud you put your hands on your thighs, clenching all the fingers of the right hand except your forefinger which you extend with its side uppermost."

Meaning: the side of the finger is facing upwards, while the bottom of the finger is neither facing the sky or the earth.

There is some difference of opinion as regards the movement of this finger. There are those who say that by holding it straight you are indicating that Allah is one God while those who move it say that doing so repels shaytan. I think they mean by this that you will be reminded in your prayer by moving your finger of what will prevent you, if Allah wills, from becoming forgetful and distracted. Your left hand is laid flat on your left thigh and you neither move it nor point with it.

Al-Qadi Abu Bakr ibn Al-Arabi said:

وعجباً ممن يقول انها مقمعة للشيطان
اذا حُرِّكت، واعلموا أنَّكم اذا حرَّكتم للشيطان أصبعاً حرَّك لكم عشراً، انما
يقمع الشيطان بالاخلاص والخشوع والذكر والاستعاذه، فأما بتحريكه فلا،
انما عليه أن يشير بالسَّبابَة.

Translation:

"And I wonder at he who says it repels the shaytan if it is moved! And know that if you move for shaytan one finger, he will move for you ten. Shaytan is only repelled by sincerity, khushoo' (submissiveness/ reverence/ awe), dhikr, and seeking refuge in Allah from him. But from moving it, no! One should only point with the forefinger."

And he said:

"إياكم وتحريك أصابعكم في التشهد، ولا تلتفتوا لراية العتيبة، فانها بليّة"

"Beware of moving your fingers in the tashahhud! And don't pay attention to the narration in the Utbiyya, for it is a catastrophe/scourge."

[the narration found in the Utbiyya book that he refers to is a report that someone saw Imam Maalik moving his finger in the fajr prayer.]

And most hadiths say that the Messenger of Allah, salla Allahu

alayhi wa sallam, used to clench the fingers of his right hand and make a ring, except the forefinger with which he would point.

There is only one narration that he, sallal lahu alaihi wasallam, moved his finger, and it has been questioned.

Now, the Maalikis used to be the only people to move the finger, based on the report in the Utbiyya which al-Qadi Abu Bakr ibn al-Arabi attacked, and they moved it from side to side.

Ibn al Hajib al-Maaliki has also clearly mentioned in his al Mukhtasar of Fiqh that the most famous view of Imam Maalik is not to move the finger. Besides, the movement of the finger even according to those Maaliki scholars who are of that opinion is quite different from the constant and rigorous shaking that some people practice.

Then al-Albani came with a novel interpretation of the hadith of moving the finger, and for the first time in history, he began moving his finger up and down!!

Shafi'i Fiqh

Imam Nawawi said in 'al-Majmu" (3/398):

"And should one move his finger when lifting it to point with it? There are several opinions on this. The correct one - which is the clear opinion of the majority of scholars - is that one should not move his finger, and if he does happen to move it, this is makruh and does not nullify his prayer due to it being a minor movement. The second opinion is that it is haram to move his finger, and his prayer is nullified if he moves it...and this is a weak opinion. The third opinion is that it is mustahab to move it, and their proof for this is the hadith of Wa'il bin Hujr in which he described the Messenger of Allah placing his hands in the tashahhud, saying: "Then, he would raise his finger, and I saw him moving it to make supplications." This was reported by al-Bayhaqi with an authentic chain, and al-Bayhaqi said: "It is possible that what is meant by 'moving it' is that he lifted it up to point with it, not that he would move it repeatedly.""

Imam An Nawawi says it in his Minhaaj ut Talibin:

"When the Shahada is read in the Tashahhud one should raise his finger at saying "illal-laah". The finger will not be moved. According to the zahir qawl the thumb will be joined to the indexfinger."

The narration of Ibn az-Zubair Radi Allahu anhu, who reported, "The Prophet (Sallal laho alaihi wasallam) would point with his finger while supplicating, and he would not move it." This is related by Abu Dawud. Imam Nawawi also mentioned it.

Imam al-Bayhaqi and Nawawi were great shafi'i scholars of hadith who followed this hadith of Ibn al-Zubair, besides so many other scholars of hadith.

Umdat al-Salik wa Uddat al-Nasik – [This book gives the Shafi Madhhab's views] by Sheikh Ahmad Ibn Naqib al-Misri, d. 769AH /1368 CE; Rehmatullah alaih, states:

"One does not move it while it is thus raised (Sheikh Umar Barakat said in his commentary to Umdat al-Salik: following the Sunnah from a hadith related by Abu Dawud. It is offensive to move it here, though some hold that it is recommended, the evidence for which is also from the Sunnah, in a hadith related by Bayhaqi, who states both hadiths are rigorously authenticated (Sahih). Precedence is given to the former hadith (i.e of Ibn Az-Zubair), which negates moving the finger, over the latter hadith, which affirms it, because scholars hold that what is sought in prayer is lack of motion, and moving it diminishes one's humility)."

Hanbali Fiqh

Ibn Qudamah al-Maqdisi said in 'al-Mughni' (1/524):

"One should point with his index finger upon mentioning Allah in the tashahhud due to what we have narrated, and he should not move it."

"Uthman bin Ahmad al-Hanbali said in 'Hidayat ar-Raghib li Sharh 'Umdat at-Talib' (p. 126):

"So, he should raise his finger without moving it around in the tashahhud and while supplicating in his prayer."

Ibn Hazm al-Andalusi said in 'al-Muhalla' (4/151):

"And we prefer that when the one in prayer sits for the tashahhud, he points with his finger and does not move it."

This was also affirmed by Muqbil al-Wad'i in 'as-Sahih al-Musnad' (2/265).

OOOO

(Part IV)

When to stand up during Iqamah

Some people say that it is not necessary to stand up during the time of Iqamah when the Mukabbir (person who pronounces iqamah) says "حى على الصلوة" Hayya alal Salah" or "حى على الفلاح" Hayya alal Falaah", rather one should stand at the beginning of the Iqamah.

At the time of takbeer there is instruction to keep sitting. It is abominable and forbidden to stand. When the person who is calling takbeer pronounces hay'ya alal falah (come towards prosperity) the persons should stand.

In this connection the clarification of the honorable jurists and commentators of hadiths are given below:

The Ulama [scholars] of Islam have explained the three different ways of standing up during the Iqamah for the purpose of following the Jamaat (congregation). They are:

- (1.1) When the Imam enters the Masjid from the side of Mihraab (niche)
- (1.2) When the Imam enters the Masjid from the back or from the sides, and
- (1.3) when both the Imam and Muqtadis (followers) are present in the Masjid at the time of Iqamah.

As far as the first two methods (1.1 and 1.2) are concerned; no differences exist amongst any group.

Allama Abu Bakr Bin Masud al Kasani (d.587/1191) writes in "Bada'iu al-Sanai' fi Tartibi al-Sharai'. "If the Imam is outside the masjid, the muqtadis will not stand until the Imam does not arrive. If the Imam enters the Masjid from the front of the Saf (row) and when the Muqtadis see the Imam, they should stand up because when Imam enters the Masjid, it is regarded as if he has reached the place of Imamatus. If the Imam enters the Masjid from the back of the rows, according to correct saying, from whichever row the

Imam passes, the people of that row should stand up." (Kitab al Salat)

2 Allama Zayn al-Abidin Ibrahim al-shahir bi-Ibn Nujaym al-Misri al-Hanafi (d.970/1563), writes in al-Bahr al-raiq": "If the Imam is not in the Mihraab (niche), then the people of every row should stand when the Imam reaches them. If the Imam enters the Masjid from the front, the people should stand up when they see the Imam."

It is seen that in present time point number (1.3) above is the usual case.

And in this situation the ruling as per Hanafi fiqh is:

"When the Imam and the Muqtadis all are present in the Masjid, then it is Mustahab (recommended) for all of them to stand up for Jamaat when Mu'azzin says "Hayya alal Salaah" or "Hayya alal Falaah".

From salaf as-saliheen

1. Umar ibn Abdul-Aziz said: "When the mu'azzin says "qad-qaamatis salah" then stand; now the salah has been established. [Ibn Abi Shaybah, al-Musannaf, 356]

2. Ibn Jurayz asked "Ata if it was correct that it had been said that when the mu'azzin says " qad-qaamatis salah" then the people should stand. Ata' said: "Yes". [Abdur-Razzaq, al-Musannaf, 505]

3. Imam Muhammad narrated from Ibrahim al-Nakhai: "When the mu'azzin says hay'ya alal fala'ah then the people should stand and make rows. When the mu'azzin says qad qamatis salah then the imam should say the takbeer." He adds this is the opinion of [Imam] Abu Hanifa and we adhere to it and if the imam waits until the mu'azzin finishes the iqamah and then says the takbeer, there is no harm in it either. All this is fine." [Imam Abu Hanifa, al-athar, 21]

4. In the Muwatta of Imam Muhammed.

In the chapter of salah; section 32 under the topic of "straightening the rows" the third narration states:

"Muhammed said: "when the caller to prayer (mu'azzin) has said

Hayya alal falaah, the people ought to stand to pray, form rows, straighten the rows and place their shoulders together. Then when the mu'azzin has said Qad-qaamatis salah, the imam should say Allahu akbar. That is the verdict of Imam Abu hanifa, may Allah have mercy on him.

5 Muhammad said, "Abu Hanifah informed us saying, "Talha ibn Musarrif narrated to us that Ibrahim said, "When the mu'azzin says, hayya alal falaah ['Hasten to success,'] people ought to stand and form rows, and then when the mu'azzin says, qad qaamatis salah ['Prayer is about to begin,'] the imam says the takbeer."

Muhammad said, "We adhere to this and it is the verdict of Abu Hanifa, may Allah, exalted is He, have mercy on him. But if the imam waits until the mu'azzin finishes his iqamah and then says takbeer, there is also no harm in this, all of that is good" (Kitab ul Athar, page 39)

RULING FROM JURISTS

The great Jurists and scholars of Islam have explained this issue in detail:-

1. Allama Abu Bakr Bin Masud al-Kasani writes: "If the Imam and the Muqtadis are present in the Masjid, then it is Mustahab (recommended) for all of them to stand when the Mu'azzin says 'Hayya alal Falaah'." (Badaiu al-sanai)

2. It is mentioned in Tanveer al-absaar [by Sheikh Shams al-din Muhamamad Bin Abdullah-al-Ghazi (A.H. 995)], "If the Imam is near the Mihraab (niche), then Imam and the Muqtadi should both stand up at the time of 'Hayya alal Falaah'." (Kitab al Salat)

3. Allama Ibn Abideen Shami (1198/1252AH) has given thirteen references of authentic books that people should stand up at the time of "Hayya alal Salaah" or "Hayya alal Falaah."

4. It is mentioned in Tabin al haqaiq "When the Mu'azzin says 'Hayya alal Falaah' he in fact has commanded for Qiyaam (standing). Therefore, it is Mustahab (recommended) to hurry towards it." (Kitab al Salat)

Note: Tabeen al-Haqaiq is a commentary on Kanz al-daqa'iq fi al

furu. Kanz al-daqa'iq was written by Imam Abdullah Ibn Ahmad Ibn Mahmood Al-Nasafi (d. 710 AH). Tabeen al-haqaiq was written by Imam Al-Hafiz Al-Zaili Al-Hanafi (d. 747 AH).

5. It is mentioned in Durar al-hukkam fi sharh ghurar al-ahkaam (by Muhammad bin Faramurz bin Ali Mulla Khusraw al-Tarasusi, d. 885 AH): "Standing up is in that time when it is said 'Hayya alal Falaah'. The meaning of 'Hayya alal Falaah' is 'come, be attentive'. Therefore, it is Mustahab to hurry towards it." (Kitab al Salat)

6. Imam Abu Hanifa and Imam Muhammad said that people should stand in rows when the Mu'azzin says "Hayya alal Salah". (Umdah al-Qari fi Sharh Sahih al Bukhari" written by Imam Badr al-Din al-Ayni al hanafi, d. 855 AH)

7. Imam al Qastalani (d. 923 AH) writes in Irshad al-Sari li Sharh Sahih al-Bukhari: "It is reported from Imam Abu Hanifa that people should stand at the time of 'Hayya alal Falaah'."

8. There exists in 'Durr al Mukhtar' with 'Radd al Muhtar' Vol. 1, P. 322:

"Standing of Imam and followers at the time of pronouncing hayya alal falaah is desirable."

9. There is in Sharah Waqaya Vol. 1, Majeedi P. 136:

"Let imam and followers stand when hayya alal salah is pronounced"

10. Sheikh Hasan bin Ali shurunbulali writes in Miraqiul Falaah:

"if imam is present near the niche (Mahrab) in the mosque then the etiquette of the prayer is that the imam and the followers should stand when Mukabbir pronounce hayya alal falaah."

11. Mulla Ali Qari Writes in Mirqat Sharah Mishkat vol. 1, P. 419:

"Our Honourable Imams Hazrat Imam Aazam, Imam Abu Yusuf and Imam Muhammad Rahmatullah Alahim have said that the Imam and the followers should stand at the time of pronouncing hyya alal falaah."

12. Hazrat Sheikh Abdul Haq Mohaddith Dehlvi Bukhari

Rahmatullah Alaih writes in 'Ash'atul Lamat, Vol. 1, page. 321:

"The honourable jusists state Madhab is that one should stand at the time of pronouncing hayya alal salah."

13. Nawab Qutbuddin khan writes in Mazahir al Haq (the Urdu translation of Mishkat) that the jurists have written that when mukabbir pronounces hayya alal salah the followers should stand at that time .

14. Qadi Thanaullah paani-pati writes in ma la budda minh, P. 44:

"The Imam should stand at the pronouncement of hayya alal salah."

Thus, it has been made clear with many quotations of Fiqh and commentaries of Ahadith that when the Imam is near the Mihraab (niche) in the Masjid it is Mustahab (recommended) to stand at the time of "Hayya alal Salah" or "Hayya alal Falaah".

If one stands up at the beginning of the Iqaamah, then it is Makruh (disliked):

1. Mulla Nizaamuddin writes in "Fatawa Aalamgiri", which is a very authentic Fatwa book in Hanafi Fiqh, that: "It is Makruh (undesirable act in Shari'ah) to stand and wait. In fact, one should sit down and when the Mu'azzin says 'Hayya alal Falaah' then stand up."

2. Allama Sayed Ahmad Tahtawi (d.1289 AH) writes in al Maraqui al-Falah: "When the Mu'azzin starts the Iqamat and a person entered the Masjid at that time, he should sit down. He must not stand and wait because it is Makruh as it is mentioned in 'Jaami'ul-Muzmiraat ' of Qahstaani. It is known from here that to stand in the beginning of Iqamah is Makruh, and many people are unaware of this fact".

3. Mufti Shareeful Haq Amjadi, the Mufti of Jamia Ashrafiya Mubarakpur mentions twenty one books of Hanafi Fiqah to prove that it is Makruh to stand at Iqamah, that it should be heard sitting and that people should stand at the time of "Hayya alal Salah" or "Hayya alal Falaah".

4. Allama Abdur Rahman Al Jaziri (d.1360 AH) writes: "According

to shafi' fiqh it is Sunnah to stand for Salah when the Mu'azzin completes the Iqamah." (Al-Fiqh ala al-madhahib al-Arba'ah) If a person following shafi'i fiqh stands in the beginning of the Iqamah, then he loses the reward of the Sunnah.

Some people say that it is difficult to straighten the Saf (row) if people stand at "Hayya alal Salah" or at "Hayya alal Falaah", therefore, it is better to stand up in the beginning of the Iqamah. In reply to this: Could the sahaba, Taab'in and great Jurists not understand this reason? In that period there were neither markings made in the Masjid nor were there carpets and mats. Nowadays, in every Masjid, all the necessary arrangements are made to keep the rows straight. The reason for not having the rows straight in good time is not that the people stand at the time of "Hayya alal Salah". In fact, the real reason for not having the rows straight in good time is that people come into the masjid and sit here and there. When the Iqamah begins, they hesitate to come in front quickly. This evil practice should be stopped.

Some people say that in Sharah Waqaya and in some other books it is said that the people should stand up at the time of "Hay'ya alal Salah" and in "Fatawa Hindiya" and in some other books it is said that people should stand up at the time of "Hayya alal Falaah". Which one of these two sayings should one practice? In reply to this Imam-e Ahle Sunnat, Imam Ahmad Ridha Khan Bareilvi says: "In my view, there is no contradiction in the sayings of Sharah Waqaya and Fatawa Hindiya because the first saying is attributed to the end of "Hay'ya alal Salah" and the second saying is attributed to the beginning of "Hayya alal Falaah". In fact, both the sayings are practiced together. It means that people should start standing when the Mu'azzin is ending Hayya alal Salah" and they should be upright when he is at "Hay'ya alal Falaah". (Fatawa Ridhwiyya)

Note 2

Some people say that there is instruction to the Imam to begin the salah calling takbeer-e-tahreema (Allahu-Akbar) immediately after the pronouncement of Qad qamati-s-Salah: hence if the people would stand on the pronouncement of hay'ya alal falah then the rows would not get straightened for which the hadith is highly

emphatic. And if the rows are set right, by the time takbeer-e-ula (initial takbeer) will be missed, therefore people should stand in the very beginning of iqamah.

The comment on this statement is that: let the Imam begin the prayer calling takbeer e tahreema just when Qad qamati-s-Salah is pronounced; this is desirable according to both sides. And while 'iqamah' to remain standing prior to the pronouncement of hayya alal salah is abominable as it has already been discussed with reference to Fatawa Alamgiri, Radd al-Muhtar Tahtavi al-Maraql al-Falah and Umdat al-Raya. Hence if the followers could not get takbeer-e-ula in an effort to keep away from this abomination. Then the Imam should delay Takber e Tahreema.

This is because there are three advantages in calling Takbeer e Tahreema after the pronouncement of Iqamah.

Both Imam and the followers will be able to respond completely to the call of iqamah by mua'zzin which is desirable.

The Mu'azzin will finish calling iqamah and thus will be able to get takbeer-e-ula (initial takbeer) and this is also desirable.

The followers will be able to keep away from the abomination and will straighten the rows as well. If the imam practices a desirable act, to begin the salah after having called takbeer-e-tahreema immediately after the pronouncement of Qad qamati-s-Salah then he himself and the followers themselves will have to desist from another desirable act, i.e. none of them will be able to respond completely to the iqamah, and secondly, the mu'azzin will not be able to get takbeer-e-ula.

And third one is that the followers will have to be tainted with abomination by standing prior to the pronouncement of for setting the rows straight, hence for a desirable act, it will not be alright to commit abomination rather under the circumstances the desirable act will have to be given up as Imam Ibn Hummam has written in Fath al-Qadir Vol.1, P 202:

"When along with the commitment of abomination some other desirable acts are also forsaken, then that desirable act (which has caused all these) will not be pursued. That is why the masses

and the inhabitants of Harmain act according to the assertion of Imam Abu Yusuf, i.e. the Imam should not call takbeer e tahreema just after the pronouncement of Qad qamati-s-Salah, and rather he should begin the prayer when the iqamah is over." (Sharah Waqaya P. 63).

Moreover, the practice to put the rows in order even after the pronouncement of iqamah is established by the Prophet salal lahu alaihi wasallam himself. For instance, Hazrat Numan bin Basheer Radi Allah ta'ala anhu narrates that the Holy Prophet Sallal lahu alaihi wa sallam stood up to offer salah and he was about to call takber-e- tahreema that he caught sight of a person whose chest was getting out of the row. The Prophet salal lahu alaihi wasallam asserted, "O devotees to Allah! Straighten your rows." (Mishkat P. 97. Narration of Muslim). In Addition to this it has be narrated in regard to Umar Farooq-e-aadham and Uthman Ghani Radi Allahu ta'ala anhuma, that they also did not use to call takbeer-e-tahreema although, pronouncement of iqamah got over; instead they would begin the prayer on getting the infromation that rows were set right. (Mo'atta of Imam Muhammad, P. 88, Published in Deoband)

OOOO

AHLE SUNNAH BOOKS

ENGLISH BOOKS

- ☆ Kitabus Salaat By: Sayyid Aley Rasool Nazmi
- ☆ Fabrications (Tehrifaat) By: Engg. Fazlullah Chishti
- ☆ 4 Important Issues By: Engg. Fazlullah Chishti
- ☆ Deoband V/s. Deoband By: Muhammad Zubair Qadri

اردو کتابیں

- ☆ تحریفات
- ☆ چار اہم مسائل
- ☆ دیوبند بمقابلہ دیوبند
- ☆ میں سنی کیوں ہوا؟
- ☆ انجینئر فضل اللہ چشتی
- ☆ انجینئر فضل اللہ چشتی
- ☆ محمد زبیر قادری
- ☆ ڈاکٹر محمد سلیمان قادری

ہندی کتابیں

- ☆ چار اہم مسائل
- ☆ دیوبند بمقابلہ دیوبند
- ☆ میں سنی کیوں ہوا؟
- ☆ انجینئر فضل اللہ چشتی
- ☆ محمد زبیر قادری
- ☆ ڈاکٹر محمد سلیمان قادری

اہل حق کا ترجمان

مسئلہ

اہل حق کے مسلک کو جاننے، سمجھنے اور اپنانے کے لیے پڑھیے مسلک

ایڈیٹر: محمد زبیر قادری

Falaah Research Foundation

Behind Mobile Shop, Shop No. 47, G. M. Road, Next to
Kumar Hotel, Chembur, Mumbai - 400 089. India
email: zubairqadri@in.com / Cell No. 98679 34085

Published by

FALAAH RESEARCH FOUNDATION

Mumbai